

STATISTICAL SCIENCE

Volume 33, Number 2

May 2018

Special Section on Missing Data

Introduction to the Special Section on Missing Data	<i>Julie Josse and Jerome P. Reiter</i>	139
Multiple Imputation: A Review of Practical and Theoretical Findings	<i>Jared S. Murray</i>	142
Multiple Imputation for Multilevel Data with Continuous and Binary Variables <i>Vincent Audigier, Ian R. White, Shahab Jolani, Thomas P. A. Debray, Matteo Quartagno, James Carpenter, Stef van Buuren and Matthieu Resche-Rigon</i>		160
Introduction to Double Robust Methods for Incomplete Data	<i>Shaun R. Seaman and Stijn Vansteelandt</i>	184
Bayesian Approaches for Missing Not at Random Outcome Data: The Role of Identifying Restrictions	<i>Antonio R. Linero and Michael J. Daniels</i>	198
Causal Inference: A Missing Data Perspective	<i>Peng Ding and Fan Li</i>	214
Flexible Low-Rank Statistical Modeling with Missing Data and Side Information	<i>William Fithian and Rahul Mazumder</i>	238

General Section

Missing Information Principle: A Unified Approach for General Truncated and Censored Survival Data Problems	<i>Yifei Sun, Jing Qin and Chiung-Yu Huang</i>	261
Marie-France Bru and Bernard Bru on Dice Games and Contracts	<i>Glenn Shafer</i>	277
Dice Games	<i>Marie-France Bru and Bernard Bru</i>	285

Statistical Science [ISSN 0883-4237 (print); ISSN 2168-8745 (online)], Volume 33, Number 2, May 2018. Published quarterly by the Institute of Mathematical Statistics, 3163 Somerset Drive, Cleveland, OH 44122, USA. Periodicals postage paid at Cleveland, Ohio and at additional mailing offices.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Statistical Science*, Institute of Mathematical Statistics, Dues and Subscriptions Office, 9650 Rockville Pike—Suite L2310, Bethesda, MD 20814-3998, USA.

Copyright © 2018 by the Institute of Mathematical Statistics
Printed in the United States of America

Statistical Science

Volume 33, Number 2 (139–297) May 2018

Volume 33

Number 2

May 2018

Special Section on Missing Data

Introduction to the Special Section on Missing Data

Julie Josse and Jerome P. Reiter

Multiple Imputation: A Review of Practical and Theoretical Findings

Jared S. Murray

Multiple Imputation for Multilevel Data with Continuous and Binary Variables

Vincent Audigier, Ian R. White, Shahab Jolani, Thomas P. A. Debray, Matteo Quartagno, James Carpenter, Stef van Buuren and Matthieu Resche-Rigon

Introduction to Double Robust Methods for Incomplete Data

Shaun R. Seaman and Stijn Vansteelandt

Bayesian Approaches for Missing Not at Random Outcome Data: The Role of Identifying Restrictions

Antonio R. Linero and Michael J. Daniels

Causal Inference: A Missing Data Perspective

Peng Ding and Fan Li

Flexible Low-Rank Statistical Modeling with Missing Data and Side Information

William Fithian and Rahul Mazumder

General Section

Missing Information Principle: A Unified Approach for General Truncated and Censored Survival Data Problems

Yifei Sun, Jing Qin and Chiung-Yu Huang

Marie-France Bru and Bernard Bru on Dice Games and Contracts

Glenn Shafer

Dice Games

Marie-France Bru and Bernard Bru

EDITOR

Cun-Hui Zhang
Rutgers University

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Peter Bühlmann
ETH Zürich
Jiahua Chen
University of British Columbia
Rong Chen
Rutgers University
Rainer Dahlhaus
University of Heidelberg
Peter J. Diggle
Lancaster University
Robin Evans
University of Oxford
Edward I. George
University of Pennsylvania
Peter Green
*University of Bristol and
University of Technology
Sydney*
Julie Josse
Ecole Polytechnique, France
Theo Kypraios
University of Nottingham
Steven Lalley
University of Chicago
Ian McKeague
Columbia University

Vladimir Minin
University of California, Irvine
Peter Müller
University of Texas
Sonia Petrone
Bocconi University
Nancy Reid
University of Toronto
Jerry Reiter
Duke University
Richard Samworth
University of Cambridge
Bodhisattva Sen
Columbia University
Glenn Shafer
*Rutgers Business
School—Newark and
New Brunswick
Royal Holloway College,
University of London*
David Siegmund
Stanford University
Dylan Small
University of Pennsylvania
Michael Stein
University of Chicago

Eric Tchetgen Tchetgen
*Harvard School of Public
Health*
Alexandre Tsybakov
Université Paris 6
Yee Whye Teh
University of Oxford
Jon Wakefield
University of Washington
Guenther Walther
Stanford University
Jon Wellner
University of Washington
Yihong Wu
Yale University
Minge Xie
Rutgers University
Bin Yu
*University of California,
Berkeley*
Ming Yuan
*University of
Wisconsin-Madison*
Tong Zhang
Tencent AI Lab
Harrison Zhou
Yale University

MANAGING EDITOR

T. N. Sriram
University of Georgia

PRODUCTION EDITOR

Patrick Kelly

EDITORIAL COORDINATOR

Kristina Mattson

PAST EXECUTIVE EDITORS

Morris H. DeGroot, 1986–1988
Carl N. Morris, 1989–1991
Robert E. Kass, 1992–1994
Paul Switzer, 1995–1997
Leon J. Gleser, 1998–2000
Richard Tweedie, 2001
Morris Eaton, 2001
George Casella, 2002–2004
Edward I. George, 2005–2007
David Madigan, 2008–2010
Jon A. Wellner, 2011–2013
Peter Green, 2014–2016

Introduction to the Special Section on Missing Data

Julie Josse and Jerome P. Reiter

REFERENCES

- BAKER, R., BRICK, J. M., BATES, N. A., BATTAGLIA, M., COUPER, M. P., DEVER, J. A., GILE, K. J. and TOURANGEAU, R. (2013). Summary report of the AAPOR task force on non-probability sampling. *Journal of Survey Statistics and Methodology* **1** 90–143.
- LITTLE, R. J. A. and RUBIN, D. B. (2002). *Statistical Analysis with Missing Data*, 2nd ed. Wiley, Hoboken, NJ. [MR1925014](#)
- MADDEN, J. M., LAKOMA, M. D., RUSINAK, D., LU, C. Y. and SOUMERAI, S. B. (2016). Missing clinical and behavioral health data in a large electronic health record (ehr) system. *Journal of the American Medical Informatics Association* **23** 1143–1149.
- MOHAN, K. and PEARL, J. (2018). Graphical models for processing missing data. Technical Report, Dept. Computer Science, Univ. California, Los Angeles.
- NATIONAL RESEARCH COUNCIL (2013). *Nonresponse in Social Science Surveys*. Panel on a research agenda for the future of social science data collection. Committee on National Statistics, Division of Behavioral and Social Sciences and Education. The National Academies Press, Washington, DC.
- RUBIN, D. (1974). Estimating causal effects of treatments in randomized and nonrandomized studies. *J. Educ. Psychol.* **66** 688–701.
- XIE, X. and MENG, X.-L. (2017). Dissecting multiple imputation from a multi-phase inference perspective: What happens when God’s, imputer’s and analyst’s models are uncongenial? *Statist. Sinica* **27** 1485–1545. [MR3701490](#)

Multiple Imputation: A Review of Practical and Theoretical Findings

Jared S. Murray

Abstract. Multiple imputation is a straightforward method for handling missing data in a principled fashion. This paper presents an overview of multiple imputation, including important theoretical results and their practical implications for generating and using multiple imputations. A review of strategies for generating imputations follows, including recent developments in flexible joint modeling and sequential regression/chained equations/fully conditional specification approaches. Finally, we compare and contrast different methods for generating imputations on a range of criteria before identifying promising avenues for future research.

Key words and phrases: Missing data, proper imputation, congeniality, chained equations, fully conditional specification, sequential regression multivariate imputation.

REFERENCES

- ABAYOMI, K., GELMAN, A. and LEVY, M. (2008). Diagnostics for multivariate imputations. *J. Roy. Statist. Soc. Ser. C* **57** 273–291. [MR2440009](#)
- AKANDE, O., LI, F. and REITER, J. (2017). An empirical comparison of multiple imputation methods for categorical data. *Amer. Statist.* **71** 162–170. [MR3668704](#)
- ANDRIDGE, R. R. and LITTLE, R. J. A. (2010). A review of hot deck imputation for survey non-response. *Int. Stat. Rev.* **78** 40–64.
- ARNOLD, B. C., CASTILLO, E. and SARABIA, J. M. (2001). Conditionally specified distributions: An introduction. *Statist. Sci.* **16** 249–274. [MR1874154](#)
- ARNOLD, B. C. and PRESS, J. S. (1989). Compatible conditional distributions. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **84** 152–156. [MR0999673](#)
- AUDIGIER, V., HUSSON, F. and JOSSE, J. (2016). Multiple imputation for continuous variables using a Bayesian principal component analysis. *J. Stat. Comput. Simul.* **86** 2140–2156. [MR3491013](#)
- AUDIGIER, V., HUSSON, F. and JOSSE, J. (2017). MIMCA: Multiple imputation for categorical variables with multiple correspondence analysis. *Stat. Comput.* **27** 501–518. [MR3599686](#)
- BANERJEE, A., MURRAY, J. and DUNSON, D. B. (2013). Bayesian learning of joint distributions of objects. In *Proceedings of the 16th International Conference on Artificial Intelligence and Statistics (AISTATS)*, Scottsdale, AZ.
- BARNARD, J. and RUBIN, D. B. (1999). Miscellanea. Small-sample degrees of freedom with multiple imputation. *Biometrika* **86** 948–955.
- BERNAARDS, C. A., BELIN, T. R. and SCHAFER, J. L. (2007). Robustness of a multivariate normal approximation for imputation of incomplete binary data. *Stat. Med.* **26** 1368–1382. [MR2345726](#)
- BLACKWELL, M., HONAKER, J. and KING, G. (2015). A unified approach to measurement error and missing data. *Sociol. Methods Res.* **46** 303–341.
- BÖHNING, D., SEIDEL, W., ALFÓ, M., GAREL, B., PATILEA, V., WALTHER, G., DI ZIO, M., GUARNERA, U. and LUZI, O. (2007). Imputation through finite Gaussian mixture models. *Comput. Statist. Data Anal.* **51** 5305–5316. [MR2370885](#)
- BONDARENKO, I. and RAGHUNATHAN, T. (2016). Graphical and numerical diagnostic tools to assess suitability of multiple imputations and imputation models. *Stat. Med.* **35** 3007–3020. [MR3528239](#)
- BREIMAN, L. (2001). Random forests. *Mach. Learn.* **45** 5–32.
- BREIMAN, L., FRIEDMAN, J., STONE, C. J. and OLSHEN, R. A. (1984). *Classification and Regression Trees*. Wadsworth Advanced Books and Software, Belmont, CA. [MR0726392](#)
- BURGETTE, L. F. and REITER, J. P. (2010). Multiple imputation for missing data via sequential regression trees. *Am. J. Epidemiol.* **172** 1070–1076.
- CARPENTER, J. and KENWARD, M. (2013). *Multiple Imputation and Its Application*, 1st ed. Wiley, New York.
- CHEN, J. and SHAO, J. (2000). Nearest neighbor imputation for survey data. *J. Off. Stat.* **16** 113–131.
- COLE, S. R., CHU, H. and GREENLAND, S. (2006). Multiple-imputation for measurement-error correction. *Int. J. Epidemiol.* **35** 1074–1081.

Jared S. Murray is Assistant Professor of Statistics, Department of Information, Risk, and Operations Management, and Department of Statistics and Data Science, University of Texas at Austin, 12110 Speedway B6500, Austin, Texas 78712, USA (e-mail: jared.murray@mcombs.utexas.edu).

- COLLINS, L. M., SCHAFFER, J. L. and KAM, C. M. (2001). A comparison of inclusive and restrictive strategies in modern missing data procedures. *Psychol. Methods* **6** 330–351.
- DEYOREO, M., REITER, J. P. and HILLYGUS, D. S. (2017). Bayesian mixture models with focused clustering for mixed ordinal and nominal data. *Bayesian Anal.* **12** 679–730. [MR3655872](#)
- DOOVE, L. L., VAN BUUREN, S. and DUSSELDORP, E. (2014). Recursive partitioning for missing data imputation in the presence of interaction effects. *Comput. Statist. Data Anal.* **72** 92–104. [MR3139350](#)
- DRECHSLER, J. (2010). Multiple imputation of missing values in the wave 2007 of the IAB Establishment Panel. IAB Discussion Paper.
- DUNSON, D. B. and XING, C. (2009). Nonparametric Bayes modeling of multivariate categorical data. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **104** 1042–1051. [MR2562004](#)
- ELLIOTT, M. R. and STETTLER, N. (2007). Using a mixture model for multiple imputation in the presence of outliers: The “healthy for life” project. *J. Roy. Statist. Soc. Ser. C* **56** 63–78. [MR2339163](#)
- FITHIAN, W. and JOSSE, J. (2017). Multiple correspondence analysis and the multilogit bilinear model. *J. Multivariate Anal.* **157** 87–102. [MR3641738](#)
- FOSDICK, B. K., DEYOREO, M. and REITER, J. P. (2016). Categorical data fusion using auxiliary information. *Ann. Appl. Stat.* **10** 1907–1929. [MR3592042](#)
- GEBREGZIABHER, M. and DESANTIS, S. M. (2010). Latent class based multiple imputation approach for missing categorical data. *J. Statist. Plann. Inference* **140** 3252–3262. [MR2659852](#)
- GELMAN, A., CARLIN, J. B., RUBIN, D. B., VEHTARI, A., DUNSON, D. B. and STERN, H. S. (2014). *Bayesian Data Analysis*, 3rd ed. CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL. [MR3235677](#)
- HE, Y. and ZASLAVSKY, A. M. (2012). Diagnosing imputation models by applying target analyses to posterior replicates of completed data. *Stat. Med.* **31** 1–18. [MR2868986](#)
- HE, Y., ZASLAVSKY, A. M., LANDRUM, M. B., HARRINGTON, D. P. and CATALANO, P. (2010). Multiple imputation in a large-scale complex survey: A practical guide. *Stat. Methods Med. Res.* **19** 653–670. [MR2744515](#)
- HEITJAN, D. F. and LITTLE, R. J. A. (1991). Multiple imputation for the fatal accident reporting system. *J. Roy. Statist. Soc. Ser. C* **40** 13–29.
- HORTON, N. J., LIPSITZ, S. R. and PARZEN, M. (2003). A potential for bias when rounding in multiple imputation. *Amer. Statist.* **57** 229–232. [MR2016255](#)
- HU, J., REITER, J. P. and WANG, Q. (2017). Dirichlet process mixture models for modeling and generating synthetic versions of nested categorical data. *Bayesian Anal.* **12** 679–703. [MR3737948](#)
- HUGHES, R. A., WHITE, I. R., SEAMAN, S. R., CARPENTER, J. R., TILLING, K. and STERNE, J. A. C. (2014). Joint modelling rationale for chained equations. *BMC Med. Res. Methodol.* **14** 28.
- IBRAHIM, J. G., LIPSITZ, S. R. and CHEN, M. H. (1999). Missing covariates in generalized linear models when the missing data mechanism is non-ignorable. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **61** 173–190. [MR1664045](#)
- IBRAHIM, J. G., CHEN, M. H., LIPSITZ, S. R. and HERRING, A. H. (2005). Missing data methods for generalized linear models: A comparative review. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **100** 332–346. [MR2166072](#)
- ISHWARAN, H. and JAMES, L. F. (2001). Gibbs sampling methods for stick-breaking priors. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **96** 161–173. [MR1952729](#)
- KIM, J. K. (2002). A note on approximate Bayesian bootstrap imputation. *Biometrika* **89** 470–477. [MR1913974](#) [MR1913974](#)
- KIM, J. K., BRICK, J. M., FULLER, W. A. and KALTON, G. (2006). On the bias of the multiple-imputation variance estimator in survey sampling. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **68** 509–521. [MR2278338](#)
- KIM, H. J., REITER, J. P., WANG, Q., COX, L. H. and KARR, A. F. (2014). Multiple imputation of missing or faulty values under linear constraints. *J. Bus. Econom. Statist.* **32** 375–386. [MR3238592](#)
- KIM, H. J., COX, L. H., KARR, A. F., REITER, J. P. and WANG, Q. (2015). Simultaneous edit-imputation for continuous microdata. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **110** 987–999. [MR3420678](#)
- KROPKO, J., GOODRICH, B., GELMAN, A. and HILL, J. (2014). Multiple imputation for continuous and categorical data: Comparing joint multivariate normal and conditional approaches. *Polit. Anal.* **22** 497–519.
- LEE, M. C. and MITRA, R. (2016). Multiply imputing missing values in data sets with mixed measurement scales using a sequence of generalised linear models. *Comput. Statist. Data Anal.* **95** 24–38. [MR3425936](#)
- LI, F., YU, Y. and RUBIN, D. B. (2012). Imputing missing data by fully conditional models: Some cautionary examples and guidelines. Dept. Statistical Science, Duke Univ., Durham, NC.
- LI, F., BACCINI, M., MEALLI, F., ZELL, E. R., FRANGAKIS, C. E. and RUBIN, D. B. (2014). Multiple imputation by ordered monotone blocks with application to the anthrax vaccine research program. *J. Comput. Graph. Statist.* **23** 877–892. [MR3224660](#)
- LIPSITZ, S. R. and IBRAHIM, J. G. (1996). A conditional model for incomplete covariates in parametric regression models. *Biometrika* **83** 916–922.
- LITTLE, R. J. A. (1988). Missing-data adjustments in large surveys. *J. Bus. Econom. Statist.* **6** 287–296.
- LITTLE, R. J. A. and RUBIN, D. B. (2002). *Statistical Analysis with Missing Data*, 2nd ed. Wiley-Interscience, Hoboken, NJ. [MR1925014](#)
- LITTLE, R. J. A. and SCHLUCHTER, M. D. (1985). Maximum likelihood estimation for mixed continuous and categorical data with missing values. *Biometrika* **72** 497–512. [MR0817564](#)
- LIU, J. S. (1994). The collapsed Gibbs sampler in Bayesian computations with applications to a gene regulation problem. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **89** 958–966. [MR1294740](#)
- LIU, C. and RUBIN, D. B. (1998). Ellipsoidally symmetric extensions of the general location model for mixed categorical and continuous data. *Biometrika* **85** 673–688. [MR1665830](#)
- LIU, J., GELMAN, A., HILL, J., SU, Y.-S. and KROPKO, J. (2014). On the stationary distribution of iterative imputations. *Biometrika* **101** 155–173. [MR3180663](#)
- MANRIQUE-VALLIER, D. and REITER, J. P. (2014a). Bayesian estimation of discrete multivariate latent structure models with structural zeros. *J. Comput. Graph. Statist.* **23** 1061–1079. [MR3270711](#)

- MANRIQUE-VALLIER, D. and REITER, J. P. (2014b). Bayesian multiple imputation for large-scale categorical data with structural zeros. *Surv. Methodol.* **40** 125–134.
- MANRIQUE-VALLIER, D. and REITER, J. P. (2016). Bayesian simultaneous edit and imputation for multivariate categorical data. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **112** 1708–1719. [MR3750893](#)
- MENG, X.-L. (1994). Multiple-imputation inferences with uncongenial sources of input. *Statist. Sci.* **9** 538–558.
- MENG, X.-L. and ROMERO, M. (2003). Discussion: Efficiency and self-efficiency with multiple imputation inference. *Int. Stat. Rev.* **71** 607–618.
- MORRIS, T. P., WHITE, I. R. and ROYSTON, P. (2014). Tuning multiple imputation by predictive mean matching and local residual draws. *BMC Med. Res. Methodol.* **14** 75.
- MURRAY, J. S. and REITER, J. P. (2016). Multiple imputation of missing categorical and continuous values via Bayesian mixture models with local dependence. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **111** 1466–1479. [MR3601702](#)
- NGUYEN, C. D., LEE, K. J. and CARLIN, J. B. (2015). Posterior predictive checking of multiple imputation models. *Biom. J.* **57** 676–694.
- NIELSEN, S. F. (2003). Proper and improper multiple imputation. *Int. Stat. Rev.* **71** 593–607.
- OLKIN, I. and TATE, R. F. (1961). Multivariate correlation models with mixed discrete and continuous variables. *Ann. Math. Stat.* **32** 448–465.
- PADDOCK, S. M. (2002). Bayesian nonparametric multiple imputation of partially observed data with ignorable nonresponse. *Biometrika* **89** 529–538. [MR1929160](#)
- RAGHUNATHAN, T. E., REITER, J. P. and RUBIN, D. B. (2003). Multiple imputation for statistical disclosure limitation. *J. Off. Stat.* **19** 1–16.
- RAGHUNATHAN, T. E., LEPKOWSKI, J. M., VAN HOEWYK, J. and SOLENBERGER, P. (2001). A multivariate technique for multiply imputing missing values using a sequence of regression models. *Surv. Methodol.* **27** 85–96.
- RÄSSLER, S. (2004). Data fusion: Identification problems, validity, and multiple imputation. *Aust. J. Stat.* **33** 153–171.
- REITER, J. P. (2002). Satisfying disclosure restrictions with synthetic data sets. *J. Off. Stat.* **18** 531.
- REITER, J. P. (2005). Using CART to generate partially synthetic public use microdata. *J. Off. Stat.* **21** 441.
- REITER, J. P. (2012). Bayesian finite population imputation for data fusion. *Statist. Sinica* **22** 795–811. [MR2954362](#)
- REITER, J. (2017). Discussion: Dissecting multiple imputation from a multi-phase inference perspective: What happens when God’s, imputer’s and analyst’s models are uncongenial? *Statist. Sinica.* **27** 1578–1583. [MR3701498](#)
- REITER, J. P. and RAGHUNATHAN, T. E. (2007). The multiple adaptations of multiple imputation. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **102** 1462–1471. [MR2372542](#)
- REITER, J. P., RAGHUNATHAN, T. E. and KINNEY, S. K. (2006). The importance of modeling the sampling design in multiple imputation for missing data. *Surv. Methodol.* **32** 143.
- ROBINS, J. M. and WANG, N. (2000). Inference for imputation estimators. *Biometrika* **87** 113–124. [MR1766832](#)
- ROUSSEAU, J. (2016). On the frequentist properties of Bayesian nonparametric methods. *Annual Review of Statistics and Its Application* **3** 211–231.
- RUBIN, D. B. (1981). The Bayesian bootstrap. *Ann. Statist.* **9** 130–134. [MR0600538](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (1987). *Multiple Imputation for Nonresponse in Surveys*. Wiley, New York. [MR0899519](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (1993). Discussion: Statistical disclosure limitation. *J. Off. Stat.* **9** 461–468.
- RUBIN, D. B. (1996). Multiple imputation after 18+ years. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **91** 473–489.
- RUBIN, D. B. (2003a). Discussion on multiple imputation. *Int. Stat. Rev.* **71** 619–625.
- RUBIN, D. B. (2003b). Nested multiple imputation of NMES via partially incompatible MCMC. *Stat. Neerl.* **57** 3–18. [MR2055518](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. and SCHAFER, J. L. (1990). Efficiently creating multiple imputations for incomplete multivariate normal data. In *Proc. Statistical Computing Section of the American Statistical Association* 83–88. Amer. Statist. Assoc., Alexandria, VA.
- RUBIN, D. B. and SCHENKER, N. (1986). Multiple imputation for interval estimation from simple random samples with ignorable nonresponse. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **81** 366–374. [MR0845877](#)
- SCHAFFER, J. L. (1997). *Analysis of Incomplete Multivariate Data*. Chapman & Hall, London. [MR1692799](#)
- SCHAFFER, J. L. (2003). Multiple imputation in multivariate problems when the imputation and analysis models differ. *Stat. Neerl.* **57** 19–35. [MR2055519](#)
- SCHENKER, N. and TAYLOR, J. M. G. (1996). Partially parametric techniques for multiple imputation. *Comput. Statist. Data Anal.* **22** 425–446.
- SCHIFELING, T. A. and REITER, J. P. (2016). Incorporating marginal prior information in latent class models. *Bayesian Anal.* **11** 499–518. [MR3472000](#)
- SEAMAN, S. R. and HUGHES, R. A. (2016). Relative efficiency of joint-model and full-conditional-specification multiple imputation when conditional models are compatible: The general location model. *Stat. Methods Med. Res.* DOI:10.1177/0962280216665872.
- SETHURAMAN, J. (1994). A constructive definition of Dirichlet priors. *Statist. Sinica* **4** 639–650. [MR1309433](#)
- SHAH, A. D., BARTLETT, J. W., CARPENTER, J., NICHOLAS, O. and HEMINGWAY, H. (2014). Comparison of random forest and parametric imputation models for imputing missing data using MICE: A CALIBER study. *Am. J. Epidemiol.* **179** 764–774.
- SI, Y. and REITER, J. P. (2013). Nonparametric Bayesian multiple imputation for incomplete categorical variables in large-scale assessment surveys. *J. Educ. Behav. Stat.* **38** 499–521.
- STUART, E. A., AZUR, M., FRANGAKIS, C. and LEAF, P. (2009). Multiple imputation with large data sets: A case study of the children’s mental health initiative. *Am. J. Epidemiol.* **169** 1133–1139.
- SU, Y.-S., GELMAN, A., HILL, J., YAJIMA, M. et al. (2011). Multiple imputation with diagnostics (mi) in R: Opening windows into the black box. *J. Stat. Softw.* **45** 1–31.
- VAN BUUREN, S. (2007). Multiple imputation of discrete and continuous data by fully conditional specification. *Stat. Methods Med. Res.* **16** 219–42.
- VAN BUUREN, S. (2012). *Flexible Imputation of Missing Data*. CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL.
- VAN BUUREN, S. and GROOTHUIS-OUDSHOORN, K. (2011). mice: Multivariate imputation by chained equations in R. *J. Stat. Softw.* **45** 1–67.

- VAN BUUREN, S. and OUDSHOORN, K. (1999). *Flexible Multivariate Imputation by MICE*. TNO Prevention Center, Leiden, The Netherlands.
- VAN BUUREN, S., BRAND, J. P. L., GROOTHUIS-OUDSHOORN, C. G. M. and RUBIN, D. B. (2006). Fully conditional specification in multivariate imputation. *J. Stat. Comput. Simul.* **76** 1049–1064. [MR2307507](#)
- VERMUNT, J. K., VAN GINKEL, J. R., VAN DER ARK, L. A. and SIJTSMA, K. (2008). Multiple imputation of incomplete categorical data using latent class analysis. *Sociol. Method.* **38** 369–397.
- VIDOTTO, D., VERMUNT, J. K. and KAPTEIN, M. C. (2015). Multiple imputation of missing categorical data using latent class models: State of art. *Psychol. Test Assess. Model.* **57** 542–576.
- VINK, G., FRANK, L. E., PANNEKOEK, J. and VAN BUUREN, S. (2014). Predictive mean matching imputation of semicontinuous variables. *Stat. Neerl.* **68** 61–90. DOI:10.1111/stan.12023. [MR3168318](#)
- WANG, N. and ROBINS, J. M. (1998). Large-sample theory for parametric multiple imputation procedures. *Biometrika* **85** 935–948. [MR1666715](#)
- XIE, X. and MENG, X.-L. (2017). Dissecting multiple imputation from a multi-phase inference perspective: What happens when God’s, imputer’s and analyst’s models are uncongenial? *Statist. Sinica.* **27** 1485–1545. [MR3701490](#)
- XU, D., DANIELS, M. J. and WINTERSTEIN, A. G. (2016). Sequential BART for imputation of missing covariates. *Biostatistics* **17** 589–602. [MR3603956](#)
- ZHU, J. and RAGHUNATHAN, T. E. (2015). Convergence properties of a sequential regression multiple imputation algorithm. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **110** 1112–1124. [MR3420688](#)

Multiple Imputation for Multilevel Data with Continuous and Binary Variables

Vincent Audigier, Ian R. White, Shahab Jolani, Thomas P. A. Debray, Matteo Quartagno, James Carpenter, Stef van Buuren and Matthieu Resche-Rigon

Abstract. We present and compare multiple imputation methods for multilevel continuous and binary data where variables are systematically and sporadically missing. The methods are compared from a theoretical point of view and through an extensive simulation study motivated by a real dataset comprising multiple studies. The comparisons show that these multiple imputation methods are the most appropriate to handle missing values in a multilevel setting and why their relative performances can vary according to the missing data pattern, the multilevel structure and the type of missing variables. This study shows that valid inferences can only be obtained if the dataset includes a large number of clusters. In addition, it highlights that heteroscedastic multiple imputation methods provide more accurate inferences than homoscedastic methods, which should be reserved for data with few individuals per cluster. Finally, guidelines are given to choose the most suitable multiple imputation method according to the structure of the data.

Key words and phrases: Missing data, systematically missing values, multilevel data, mixed data, multiple imputation, joint modelling, fully conditional specification.

REFERENCES

- ALBERT, A. and ANDERSON, J. A. (1984). On the existence of maximum likelihood estimates in logistic regression models. *Biometrika* **71** 1–10. MR0738319
- ALLISON, P. (2002). *Missing Data*. Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA.
- ANDRIDGE, R. R. (2011). Quantifying the impact of fixed effects modeling of clusters in multiple imputation for cluster randomized trials. *Biom. J.* **53** 57–74. MR2767378
- ASPAROUHOV, T. and MUTHÉN, B. (2010). Multiple imputation with Mplus. Technical report. Available at <http://www.statmodel.com/download/Imputations7.pdf>.
- AUDIGIER, V. and RESCHE-RIGON, M. (2017). micemd: Multiple imputation by chained equations with multilevel data. R package version 1.2.0.
-
- Vincent Audigier is Associate Professor, CNAM, Cedric MSDMA, Paris, France (e-mail: vincent.audigier@cnam.fr). Ian R. White is Professor, MRC Biostatistics Unit, Cambridge Institute of Public Health, United Kingdom; MRC Clinical Trials Unit at UCL, London, United Kingdom (e-mail: ian.white@ucl.ac.uk). Shahab Jolani is Assistant Professor, Department of Methodology and Statistics, School CAPHRI, Care and Public Health Research Institute, Maastricht University, The Netherlands (e-mail: s.jolani@maastrichtuniversity.nl). Thomas P. A. Debray is Assistant Professor, Julius Center for Health Sciences and Primary Care, University Medical Center Utrecht, Utrecht, The Netherlands; Cochrane Netherlands, University Medical Center Utrecht, Utrecht, The Netherlands (e-mail: T.Debray@umcutrecht.nl). Matteo Quartagno is Research Fellow, Department of Medical Statistics, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, London, United Kingdom; MRC Clinical Trials Unit at UCL, London, United Kingdom (e-mail: Matteo.Quartagno@lshtm.ac.uk). James Carpenter is Professor, Department of Medical Statistics, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, London, United Kingdom; MRC Clinical Trials Unit at UCL, London, United Kingdom (e-mail: james.carpenter@lshtm.ac.uk). Stef van Buuren is Professor, Department of Methodology & Statistics, FSS, University of Utrecht, The Netherlands; Netherlands Organisation for Applied Scientific Research TNO, Leiden, The Netherlands (e-mail: S.vanBuuren@uu.nl). Matthieu Resche-Rigon is Professor, Service de Biostatistique et Information Médicale, Hôpital Saint-Louis, AP-HP, Paris, France; Université Paris Diderot—Paris 7, Sorbonne Paris Cité, UMR-S 1153, Paris, France; INSERM, UMR 1153, Equipe ECSTRA, Hôpital Saint-Louis, Paris, France (e-mail: matthieu.resche-rigon@univ-paris-diderot.fr).

- AUDIGIER, V., WHITE, I. R., JOLANI, S., DEBRAY, T. P. A., QUARTAGNO, M., CARPENTER, J., VAN BUUREN, S. and RESCHE-RIGON, M. (2018). Supplement to “Multiple imputation for multilevel data with continuous and binary variables.” DOI:10.1214/18-STS646SUPPA, DOI:10.1214/18-STS646SUPPB.
- BARTLETT, J. W., SEAMAN, S. R., WHITE, I. R. and CARPENTER, J. R. (2015). Multiple imputation of covariates by fully conditional specification: Accommodating the substantive model. *Stat. Methods Med. Res.* **24** 462–487. MR3372102
- BATES, D., MÄCHLER, M., BOLKER, B. and WALKER, S. (2015). Fitting linear mixed-effects models using lme4. *J. Stat. Softw.* **67** 1–48.
- BLOSSFELD, H.-P., GÜNTHER ROßBACH, H. and VON MAURICE, J., eds. (2011). *Education as a Lifelong Process: The German National Educational Panel Study (NEPS)*. VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften, Wiesbaden, Germany.
- BOS, W., LANKES, E.-M., PRENZEL, M., SCHWIPPERT, K. and VALTIN, R., eds. (2003). *Erste Ergebnisse aus IGLU: Schülerleistungen Am Ende der Vierten Jahrgangsstufe Im Internationalen Vergleich [the First]*. Waxmann, Münster, Germany.
- CARPENTER, J. and KENWARD, M. (2013). *Multiple Imputation and Its Application*, 1st ed. Wiley, New York.
- CARRIG, M. M., MANRIQUE-VALLIER, D., RANBY, K. W., REITER, J. and HOYLE, R. H. (2015). A nonparametric, multiple imputation-based method for the retrospective integration of data sets. *Multivar. Behav. Res.* **50** 383–397.
- CURRAN, P. J. and HUSSONG, A. M. (2009). Integrative data analysis: The simultaneous analysis of multiple data sets. *Psychol. Methods* **14** 81–100.
- CURRAN, P. J., HUSSONG, A. M., CAI, L., HUANG, W., CHASSIN, L., SHER, K. J. and ZUCKER, R. A. (2008). Pooling data from multiple longitudinal studies: The role of item response theory in integrative data analysis. *Dev. Psychol.* **44** 365–380.
- DEBRAY, T., RILEY, R., ROVERS, M., REITSMA, J., MOONS, K. and ON BEHALF OF THE COCHRANE IPD META-ANALYSIS METHODS GROUP (2015b). Individual participant data (IPD) meta-analyses of diagnostic and prognostic modeling studies: Guidance on their use. *PLoS Med.* **12** e1001886.
- DEBRAY, T., MOONS, K., VAN VALKENHOEF, G., EFTHIMIOU, O., HUMMEL, N., GROENWOLD, R. and REITSMA, J. O. (2015a). Get real in individual participant data (IPD) meta-analysis: A review of the methodology. *Res. Synth. Methods* **6** 293–309.
- DERSIMONIAN, R. and LAIRD, N. (1986). Meta-analysis in clinical trials. *Control. Clin. Trials* **7** 177–188.
- DRECHSLER, J. (2015). Multiple imputation of multilevel missing data—rigor versus simplicity. *J. Educ. Behav. Stat.* **40** 69–95.
- ENDERS, C. (2010). *Applied Missing Data Analysis*. Guilford Press, New York.
- ENDERS, C. K., KELLER, B. T. and LEVY, R. (2017). A fully conditional specification approach to multilevel imputation of categorical and continuous variables. *Psychol. Methods*.
- ENDERS, C., MISTLER, S. and KELLER, B. (2016). Multilevel multiple imputation: A review and evaluation of joint modeling and chained equations imputation. *Psychological Methods* **21** 222–240.
- ERLER, N. S., RIZOPOULOS, D., VAN ROSMALEN, J., JADDOE, V. W. V., FRANCO, O. H. and LESAFFRE, E. M. E. H. (2016). Dealing with missing covariates in epidemiologic studies: A comparison between multiple imputation and a full Bayesian approach. *Stat. Med.* **35** 2955–2974. MR3528236
- FIRTH, D. (1993). Bias reduction of maximum likelihood estimates. *Biometrika* **80** 27–38. MR1225212
- GELMAN, A. (2006). Prior distributions for variance parameters in hierarchical models (comment on article by Browne and Draper). *Bayesian Anal.* **1** 515–533. MR2221284
- GEMAN, S. and GEMAN, D. (1984). Stochastic relaxation, Gibbs distributions, and the Bayesian restoration of images. *IEEE Trans. Pattern Anal. Mach. Intell.* **6** 721–741.
- GLOBAL RESEARCH ON ACUTE CONDITIONS TEAM (GREAT) NETWORK (2013). Managing acute heart failure in the ED—case studies from the acute heart failure academy. Available at <http://www.greatnetwork.org>.
- GOLDSTEIN, H., BONNET, G. and ROCHER, T. (2007). Multilevel structural equation models for the analysis of comparative data on educational performance. *J. Educ. Behav. Stat.* **32** 252–286.
- GOLDSTEIN, H., CARPENTER, J., KENWARD, M. G. and LEVIN, K. A. (2009). Multilevel models with multivariate mixed response types. *Stat. Model.* **9** 173–197. MR2756416
- GRAHAM, J. W. (2012). *Missing Data: Analysis and Design*. Springer, New York. MR2952499
- GRUND, S., LÜDTKE, O. and ROBITZSCH, A. (2016). Multiple imputation of missing covariate values in multilevel models with random slopes: A cautionary note. *Behav. Res. Methods* **48** 640–649.
- HUGHES, R. A., WHITE, I. R., SEAMAN, S., CARPENTER, J., TILLING, K. and STERNE, J. (2014). Joint modelling rationale for chained equations. *BMC Med. Res. Methodol.* **14** 28.
- JACKSON, D., WHITE, I. R. and RILEY, R. D. (2013). A matrix-based method of moments for fitting the multivariate random effects model for meta-analysis and meta-regression. *Biom. J.* **55** 231–245. MR3045843
- JOLANI, S. (2018). Hierarchical imputation of systematically and sporadically missing data: An approximate Bayesian approach using chained equations. *Biom. J.* **60** 333–351.
- JOLANI, S., DEBRAY, T. P. A., KOFFIJBERG, H., VAN BUUREN, S. and MOONS, K. G. M. (2015). Imputation of systematically missing predictors in an individual participant data meta-analysis: A generalized approach using MICE. *Stat. Med.* **34** 1841–1863. MR3334696
- KROPKO, J., GOODRICH, B., GELMAN, A. and HILL, J. (2014). Multiple imputation for continuous and categorical data: Comparing joint multivariate normal and conditional approaches. *Polit. Anal.* **22** 497–519.
- KUNKEL, D. and KAIZAR, E. E. (2017). A comparison of existing methods for multiple imputation in individual participant data meta-analysis. *Stat. Med.* **36** 3507–3532. MR3696506
- LANGAN, D., HIGGINS, J. P. T. and SIMMONDS, M. (2017). Comparative performance of heterogeneity variance estimators in meta-analysis: A review of simulation studies. *Res. Synth. Methods* **8** 181–198.
- LASSUS, J., GAYAT, E., MUELLER, C., PEACOCK, W., SPINAR, J., HARJOLA, V., VAN KIMMENADE, R., PATHAK, A., MUELLER, T. et al. (2013). Incremental value of biomarkers to clinical variables for mortality prediction in acutely decompensated heart failure: The multinational observational cohort on acute heart failure (MOCA) study. *Int. J. Cardiol.* **168** 2186–2194.

- LEE, K. and CARLIN, J. (2010). Multiple imputation for missing data: Fully conditional specification versus multivariate normal imputation. *Am. J. Epidemiol.* **171** 624–632.
- LEE, Y., NELDER, J. A. and PAWITAN, Y. (2006). *Generalized Linear Models with Random Effects: Unified Analysis via H-Likelihood. Monographs on Statistics and Applied Probability* **106**. Chapman & Hall/CRC, Boca Raton, FL. With 1 CD-ROM (Windows). [MR2259540](#)
- LITTLE, R. (1988). Missing-data adjustments in large surveys. *J. Bus. Econom. Statist.* **6** 287–296.
- LITTLE, R. J. A. and RUBIN, D. B. (2002). *Statistical Analysis with Missing Data*, 2nd ed. Wiley-Interscience, Hoboken, NJ. [MR1925014](#)
- LIU, J., GELMAN, A., HILL, J., SU, Y.-S. and KROPKO, J. (2014). On the stationary distribution of iterative imputations. *Biometrika* **101** 155–173. [MR3180663](#)
- LONGFORD, N. T. (2008). Missing data. In *Handbook of Multi-level Analysis* 377–399. Springer, New York. [MR2412943](#)
- MATHEW, T. and NORDSTRÖM, K. (2010). Comparison of one-step and two-step meta-analysis models using individual patient data. *Biom. J.* **52** 271–287. [MR2756877](#)
- MCNEISH, D. and STAPLETON, L. M. (2016). Modeling clustered data with very few clusters. *Multivar. Behav. Res.* **51** 495–518.
- MEBAZAA, A., GAYAT, E., LASSUS, J., MEAS, T., MUELLER, C. et al. (2013). Association between elevated blood glucose and outcome in acute heart failure: Results from an international observational cohort. *J. Am. Coll. Cardiol.* **61** 820–829.
- MENG, X. (1994). Multiple-imputation inferences with uncongenial sources of input (with discussion). *Statist. Sci.* **10** 538–573.
- MORRIS, T. P., WHITE, I. R. and CROWTHER, M. J. (2017). Using simulation studies to evaluate statistical methods. ArXiv e-prints.
- MULLIS, I., MARTIN, M., GONZALEZ, E. and KENNEDY, A. (2003). Pirls 2001 international report: Iea's study of reading literacy achievement in primary school in 35 countries. Available at: https://timssandpirls.bc.edu/pirls2001i/pdf/p1_IR_book.pdf.
- NOH, M. and LEE, Y. (2007). REML estimation for binary data in GLMMs. *J. Multivariate Anal.* **98** 896–915. [MR2325413](#)
- PINHEIRO, J. and BATES, D. (2000). *Mixed-Effects Models in S and S-PLUS*. Springer, New York.
- PINHEIRO, J., BATES, D., DEBROY, S. and SARKAR, D. (2016). nlme: Linear and nonlinear mixed effects models. R package version 3.1-128.
- QUARTAGNO, M. and CARPENTER, J. R. (2016a). Multiple imputation for IPD meta-analysis: Allowing for heterogeneity and studies with missing covariates. *Stat. Med.* **35** 2938–2954. [MR3528235](#)
- QUARTAGNO, M. and CARPENTER, J. (2016b). jomo: A package for multilevel joint modelling multiple imputation. R package version 2.2-0.
- RAGHUNATHAN, T., LEPKOWSKI, J. M., VAN HOEWYK, J. and SOLENBERGER, P. (2001). A multivariate technique for multiply imputing missing values using a sequence of regression models. *Surv. Methodol.* **27** 85–96.
- REITER, J., RAGHUNATHAN, T. E. and KINNEY, S. K. (2006). The importance of modeling the sampling design in multiple imputation for missing data. *Surv. Methodol.* **32** 143.
- RESCHÉ-RIGON, M. and WHITE, I. (2016). Multiple imputation by chained equations for systematically and sporadically missing multilevel data. *Stat. Methods Med. Res.* DOI:10.1177/0962280216666564.
- RESCHÉ-RIGON, M., WHITE, I. R., BARTLETT, J. W., PETERS, S. A. E., THOMPSON, S. G. and GROUP, P. S. (2013). Multiple imputation for handling systematically missing confounders in meta-analysis of individual participant data. *Stat. Med.* **32** 4890–4905. [MR3127183](#)
- RILEY, R. D., LAMBERT, P. C., STAESSEN, J. A., WANG, J., GUEYFFIER, F., THIJIS, L. and BOUTITIE, F. (2008). Meta-analysis of continuous outcomes combining individual patient data and aggregate data. *Stat. Med.* **27** 1870–1893. [MR2420350](#)
- RILEY, R. D., ENSOR, J., SNELL, K. I. E., DEBRAY, T. P. A., ALTMAN, D. G., MOONS, K. G. M. and COLLINS, G. S. (2016). External validation of clinical prediction models using big datasets from e-health records or IPD meta-analysis: Opportunities and challenges. *BMJ* **353** i3140.
- ROBERT, C. P. (2007). *The Bayesian Choice: From Decision-Theoretic Foundations to Computational Implementation*, 2nd ed. Springer, New York. [MR2723361](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (1976). Inference and missing data. *Biometrika* **63** 581–592. [MR0455196](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (1987). *Multiple Imputation for Nonresponse in Surveys*. Wiley, New York. [MR0899519](#)
- SCHAFFER, J. L. (1997). *Analysis of Incomplete Multivariate Data. Monographs on Statistics and Applied Probability* **72**. Chapman & Hall, London. [MR1692799](#)
- SCHAFFER, J. L. and YUCEL, R. M. (2002). Computational strategies for multivariate linear mixed-effects models with missing values. *J. Comput. Graph. Statist.* **11** 437–457. [MR1938143](#)
- SIMMONDS, M., HIGGINS, J., STEWART, L., TIERNEY, J., CLARKE, M. and THOMPSON, S. (2005). Meta-analysis of individual patient data from randomized trials: A review of methods used in practice. *Clin. Trials* **2** 209–217.
- TANNER, M. A. and WONG, W. H. (1987). The calculation of posterior distributions by data augmentation. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **82** 528–550. [MR0898357](#)
- R CORE TEAM (2016). *R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. Version 3.3.0*. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.
- VAN BUUREN, S. (2007). Multiple imputation of discrete and continuous data by fully conditional specification. *Stat. Methods Med. Res.* **16** 219–242. [MR2371007](#)
- VAN BUUREN, S. (2011). Multiple imputation of multilevel data. In *The Handbook of Advanced Multilevel Analysis* (J. J. Hox, ed.) 173–196. Routledge, New York.
- VAN BUUREN, S. (2012). *Flexible Imputation of Missing Data (Chapman & Hall/CRC Interdisciplinary Statistics)*. Chapman & Hall/CRC, London.
- VAN BUUREN, S. and GROOTHUIS-ODSHOORN, K. (2011). mice: Multivariate imputation by chained equations in R. *J. Stat. Softw.* **45** 1–67.
- VAN BUUREN, S., BRAND, J. P. L., GROOTHUIS-ODSHOORN, C. G. M. and RUBIN, D. B. (2006). Fully conditional specification in multivariate imputation. *J. Stat. Comput. Simul.* **76** 1049–1064. [MR2307507](#)
- VINK, G., LAZENDIC, G. and VAN BUUREN, S. (2015). Partitioned predictive mean matching as a multilevel imputation technique. *Psychol. Test Assess. Model.* **57** 577–594.
- WAGSTAFF, D. and HAREL, O. (2011). A closer examination of three small-sample approximations to the multiple-imputation degrees of freedom. *Stata J.* **11** 403–419.

- YUCEL, R. M. (2011). Random covariances and mixed-effects models for imputing multivariate multilevel continuous data. *Stat. Model.* **11** 351–370. [MR2906705](#)
- ZHAO, Y. and LONG, Q. (2016). Multiple imputation in the presence of high-dimensional data. *Stat. Methods Med. Res.* **25** 2021–2035. [MR3553324](#)
- ZHAO, E. and YUCEL, R. (2009). Performance of sequential imputation method in multilevel applications. In *Proceedings of the Survey Research Methods Section (JSM 2009)* 2800–2810. Amer. Statist. Assoc., Alexandria, VA.
- ZHU, J. and RAGHUNATHAN, T. E. (2015). Convergence properties of a sequential regression multiple imputation algorithm. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **110** 1112–1124. [MR3420688](#)

Introduction to Double Robust Methods for Incomplete Data

Shaun R. Seaman and Stijn Vansteelandt

Abstract. Most methods for handling incomplete data can be broadly classified as inverse probability weighting (IPW) strategies or imputation strategies. The former model the occurrence of incomplete data; the latter, the distribution of the missing variables given observed variables in each missingness pattern. Imputation strategies are typically more efficient, but they can involve extrapolation, which is difficult to diagnose and can lead to large bias. Double robust (DR) methods combine the two approaches. They are typically more efficient than IPW and more robust to model misspecification than imputation. We give a formal introduction to DR estimation of the mean of a partially observed variable, before moving to more general incomplete-data scenarios. We review strategies to improve the performance of DR estimators under model misspecification, reveal connections between DR estimators for incomplete data and “design-consistent” estimators used in sample surveys, and explain the value of double robustness when using flexible data-adaptive methods for IPW or imputation.

Key words and phrases: Augmented inverse probability weighting, calibration estimators, data-adaptive methods, doubly robust, empirical likelihood, imputation, inverse probability weighting, missing data, semiparametric methods.

REFERENCES

- [1] BANG, H. and ROBINS, J. M. (2005). Doubly robust estimation in missing data and causal inference models. *Biometrics* **61** 962–972. MR2216189
- [2] BELLONI, A. and CHERNOZHUKOV, V. (2011). l_1 -Penalized quantile regression in high-dimensional sparse models. *Ann. Statist.* **39** 82–130. MR2797841
- [3] BELLONI, A., CHERNOZHUKOV, V. and HANSEN, C. (2016). Lasso methods for Gaussian instrumental variables models. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1012.1297](https://arxiv.org/abs/1012.1297).
- [4] BROOKHART, M. A. and VAN DER LAAN, M. J. (2006). A semiparametric model selection criterion with applications to the marginal structural model. *Comput. Statist. Data Anal.* **50** 475–498. MR2201874
- [5] CAO, W., TSIATIS, A. A. and DAVIDIAN, M. (2009). Improving efficiency and robustness of the doubly robust estimator for a population mean with incomplete data. *Biometrika* **96** 723–734. MR2538768
- [6] CASSEL, C. M., SARNDAL, C. E. and WRETMAN, J. H. (1976). Some results on generalized difference estimation and generalized regression estimation for finite populations. *Biometrika* **63** 615–620. MR0445666
- [7] CHENG, G., YU, Z. and HUANG, J. Z. (2013). The cluster bootstrap consistency in generalized estimating equations. *J. Multivariate Anal.* **115** 33–47. MR3004543
- [8] CHERNOZHUKOV, V., ESCANCIANO, J. C., ICHIMURA, H. and NEWEY, W. K. (2016). Locally robust semiparametric estimation. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1608.00033](https://arxiv.org/abs/1608.00033).
- [9] FARRELL, M. H. (2015). Robust inference on average treatment effects with possibly more covariates than observations. *J. Econometrics* **189** 1–23.
- [10] GRUBER, S. and VAN DER LAAN, M. J. (2010). A targeted maximum likelihood estimator of a causal effect on a bounded continuous outcome. *Int. J. Biostat.* **6** Article 26.
- [11] HORVITZ, D. G. and THOMPSON, D. J. (1952). A generalization of sampling without replacement from a finite

Shaun R. Seaman is Senior Research Associate, Medical Research Council Biostatistics Unit, University of Cambridge, Cambridge CB2 0SR, United Kingdom (e-mail: shaun.seaman@mrc-bsu.cam.ac.uk). Stijn Vansteelandt is Professor of Statistics, Department of Applied Mathematics, Computer Science and Statistics, Ghent University, 9000 Gent, Belgium, and Department of Epidemiology and Population Health, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, London WC1E 7HT, United Kingdom.

- universe. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **47** 663–685. [MR0053460](#) [MR0053460](#)
- [12] KANG, J. D. Y. and SCHAFER, J. L. (2007). Demystifying double robustness: A comparison of alternative strategies for estimating a population mean from incomplete data. *Statist. Sci.* **22** 523–539. [MR2420458](#)
- [13] LEEB, H. and PÖTSCHER, B. M. (2005). Model selection and inference: Facts and fiction. *Econometric Theory* **21** 21–59. [MR2153856](#)
- [14] LEEB, H. and PÖTSCHER, B. M. (2006). Performance limits for estimators of the risk or distribution of shrinkage-type estimators, and some general lower risk-bound results. *Econometric Theory* **22** 69–97.
- [15] LIANG, K.-Y. and ZEGER, S. L. (1986). Longitudinal data analysis using generalised linear models. *Biometrika* **73** 13–22.
- [16] LITTLE, R. and AN, H. (2004). Robust likelihood-based analysis of multivariate data with missing values. *Statist. Sinica* **14** 949–968. [MR2089342](#)
- [17] LITTLE, R. J. A. and RUBIN, D. B. (2002). *Statistical Analysis with Missing Data*. Wiley, New York.
- [18] LONG, Q., ZHANG, X. and JOHNSON, B. A. (2011). Robust estimation of area under ROC curve using auxiliary variables in the presence of missing biomarker values. *Biometrics* **67** 559–567.
- [19] MENG, X.-L. (1994). Multiple-imputation inferences with uncongenial sources of input. *Statist. Sci.* **9** 538–573.
- [20] NEWEY, W. K., HSIEH, F. and ROBINS, J. M. (2004). Twicing kernels and a small bias property of semiparametric estimators. *Econometrica* **72** 947–962.
- [21] PAIK, M. C. (1997). The generalized estimating equations approach when data are not missing completely at random. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **92** 1320–1329.
- [22] PORTER, K. E., GRUBER, S., VAN DER LAAN, M. J. and SEKHON, J. S. (2011). The relative performance of targeted maximum likelihood estimators. *Int. J. Biostat.* **7** Article 31.
- [23] QI, L., WANG, C. Y. and PRENTICE, R. L. (2005). Weighted estimators for proportional hazards regression with missing covariates. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **100** 1250–1263. [MR2236439](#)
- [24] ROBINS, J. and ROTNITZKY, A. (1998). Discussion on the paper by Firth and Bennett. *J. Roy. Statist. Soc. Ser. B* **60** 51–52.
- [25] ROBINS, J., SUED, M., LEI-GOMEZ, Q. and ROTNITZKY, A. (2007). Comment: Performance of double-robust estimators when “inverse probability” weights are highly variable [[MR2420458](#)]. *Statist. Sci.* **22** 544–559. [MR2420460](#)
- [26] ROBINS, J. M. (2000). Robust estimation in sequentially ignorable missing data and causal inference models. In *Proceedings of the American Statistical Association Section on Bayesian Statistical Science* 1999 6–10. Amer. Statist. Assoc., Alexandria, VA.
- [27] ROBINS, J. M. and GILL, R. D. (1997). Non-response models for the analysis of non-monotone ignorable missing data. *Stat. Med.* **16** 39–56.
- [28] ROBINS, J. M., ROTNITZKY, A. and ZHAO, L. P. (1994). Estimation of regression coefficients when some regressors are not always observed. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **89** 846–866.
- [29] ROTNITZKY, A., FARAGGI, D. and SCHISTERMAN, E. (2006). Doubly robust estimation of the area under the receiver-operating characteristic curve in the presence of verification bias. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **101** 1276–1288. [MR2328313](#)
- [30] ROTNITZKY, A., LEI, Q. H., SUED, M. and ROBINS, J. M. (2012). Improved double-robust estimation in missing data and causal inference models. *Biometrika* **99** 439–456. [MR2931264](#)
- [31] ROTNITZKY, A. and VANSTEELANDT, S. (2014). Double-robust methods. In *Handbook of Missing Data Methodology* (G. Molenberghs, G. Fitzmaurice, M. G. Kenward, A. Tsiatis and G. Verbeke, eds.) 185–212. CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL.
- [32] SCHARFSTEIN, D. O., ROTNITZKY, A. and ROBINS, J. M. (1999). Adjusting for nonignorable drop-out using semiparametric nonresponse models: Rejoinder. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **94** 1135–1146.
- [33] SCHNITZER, M. E., LOK, J. J. and BOSCH, R. J. (2016). Double robust and efficient estimation of a prognostic model for events in the presence of dependent censoring. *Biostatistics* **17** 165–177. [MR3449858](#)
- [34] SEAMAN, S. and COPAS, A. (2009). Doubly robust generalized estimating equations for longitudinal data. *Stat. Med.* **28** 937–955. [MR2518358](#)
- [35] SEAMAN, S. R., GALATI, J., JACKSON, D. and CARLIN, J. (2013). What is meant by “missing at random”? *Statist. Sci.* **28** 257–268. [MR3112409](#)
- [36] SEAMAN, S. R. and VANSTEELANDT, S. (2018). Supplement to “Introduction to double robust methods for incomplete data.” DOI:[10.1214/18-STS647SUPP](#).
- [37] TAN, Z. (2006). A distributional approach for causal inference using propensity scores. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **101** 1619–1637. [MR2279484](#)
- [38] TAN, Z. (2008). Comment: Improved local efficiency and double robustness. *Int. J. Biostat.* **4** Article 10. [MR2426120](#)
- [39] TAN, Z. (2010). Bounded, efficient and doubly robust estimation with inverse weighting. *Biometrika* **97** 661–682. [MR2672490](#)
- [40] TSIATIS, A. A. (2006). *Semiparametric Theory and Missing Data*. Springer, New York. [MR2233926](#)
- [41] TSIATIS, A. A. and DAVIDIAN, M. (2014). Missing data methods: A semi-parametric perspective. In *Handbook of Missing Data Methodology* (G. Molenberghs, G. Fitzmaurice, M. G. Kenward, A. Tsiatis and G. Verbeke, eds.) Chapter 8. CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL.
- [42] TSIATIS, A. A., DAVIDIAN, M. and CAO, W. (2011). Improved doubly robust estimation when data are monotonely coarsened, with application to longitudinal studies with dropout. *Biometrics* **67** 536–545. [MR2829022](#)
- [43] VAN DER LAAN, M. J. and RUBIN, D. B. (2006). Targeted maximum likelihood learning. *Int. J. Biostat.* **2** Art. 11. [MR2306500](#)
- [44] VANSTEELANDT, S., CARPENTER, J. and KENWARD, M. G. (2015). Analysis of incomplete data using inverse probability weighting and doubly robust estimators. *Methodology* **6** 37–48.
- [45] VAN DER LAAN, M. J. and GRUBER, S. (2010). Collaborative double robust targeted maximum likelihood estimation. *Int. J. Biostat.* **6** Article 17. [MR2653848](#)
- [46] VERMEULEN, K. and VANSTEELANDT, S. (2015). Bias-reduced doubly robust estimation. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **110** 1024–1036. [MR3420681](#)

[47] WILSON, A. and REICH, B. J. (2014). Confounder selection via penalized credible regions. *Biometrics* **70** 852–861. [MR3295746](#)

[48] WIRTH, K. E., TCHETGEN TCHETGEN, E. J. and MUR-

RAY, M. (2010). Adjustment for missing data in complex surveys using doubly robust estimation. *Epidemiology* **21** 863–871.

Bayesian Approaches for Missing Not at Random Outcome Data: The Role of Identifying Restrictions

Antonio R. Linero and Michael J. Daniels

Abstract. Missing data is almost always present in real datasets, and introduces several statistical issues. One fundamental issue is that, in the absence of strong uncheckable assumptions, effects of interest are typically not nonparametrically identified. In this article, we review the generic approach of the use of identifying restrictions from a likelihood-based perspective, and provide points of contact for several recently proposed methods. An emphasis of this review is on restrictions for nonmonotone missingness, a subject that has been treated sparingly in the literature. We also present a general, fully Bayesian, approach which is widely applicable and capable of handling a variety of identifying restrictions in a uniform manner.

Key words and phrases: Missing data, MNAR, mixture models, multiple imputation, nonignorable missingness, nonparametric Bayes.

REFERENCES

- BIRMINGHAM, J., ROTNITZKY, A. and FITZMAURICE, G. M. (2003). Pattern-mixture and selection models for analysing longitudinal data with monotone missing patterns. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **65** 275–297. [MR1959827](#)
- BUNOUF, P., MOLENBERGHS, G., GROUIN, J.-M. and THUIS, H. (2015). A SAS program combining R functionalities to implement pattern-mixture models. *J. Stat. Softw.* **68** 1–26.
- CARPENTER, J. and KENWARD, M. (2012). *Multiple Imputation and Its Application*. Wiley, New York.
- CARPENTER, J., POCOCK, S. and JOHAN LAMM, C. (2002). Coping with missing data in clinical trials: A model-based approach applied to asthma trials. *Stat. Med.* **21** 1043–1066.
- COX, D. and DONNELLY, C. A. (2011). *Principles of Applied Statistics*, 1st ed. Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge. [MR2817147](#)
- CREEMERS, A., HENS, N., AERTS, M., MOLENBERGHS, G., VERBEKE, G. and KENWARD, M. G. (2010). A sensitivity analysis for shared-parameter models for incomplete longitudinal outcomes. *Biom. J.* **52** 111–125. [MR2756597](#)
- CREEMERS, A., HENS, N., AERTS, M., MOLENBERGHS, G., VERBEKE, G. and KENWARD, M. G. (2011). Generalized shared-parameter models and missingness at random. *Stat. Model.* **11** 279–310. [MR2906703](#)
- DANIELS, M. J. (1999). A prior for the variance in hierarchical models. *Canad. J. Statist.* **27** 567–578. [MR1745822](#)
- DANIELS, M. J. and HOGAN, J. W. (2000). Reparameterizing the pattern mixture model for sensitivity analyses under informative dropout. *Biometrics* **56** 1241–1248. [MR1815627](#)
- DANIELS, M. J. and HOGAN, J. W. (2008). *Missing Data in Longitudinal Studies*, 1st ed. Chapman & Hall/CRC, Boca Raton, FL.
- DANIELS, M. J. and LINERO, A. R. (2015). Bayesian nonparametrics for missing data in longitudinal clinical trials. In *Nonparametric Bayesian Inference in Biostatistics* 423–446. Springer, Cham.
- DANIELS, M. J. and LUO, X. (2017). A note on “congeniality” for missing data in the presence of auxiliary covariates. Technical report.
- DANIELS, M. J., WANG, C. and MARCUS, B. H. (2014). Fully Bayesian inference under ignorable missingness in the presence of auxiliary covariates. *Biometrics* **70** 62–72. [MR3251667](#)
- DIGGLE, P. and KENWARD, M. G. (1994). Informative drop-out in longitudinal data analysis. *Appl. Stat.* **43** 49–73.
- DUNSON, D. B. and PERREAULT, S. D. (2001). Factor analytic models of clustered multivariate data with informative censoring. *Biometrics* **57** 302–308. [MR1833321](#)
- DUNSON, D. B. and XING, C. (2009). Nonparametric Bayes modeling of multivariate categorical data. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **104** 1042–1051. [MR2562004](#)
- GASKINS, J., DANIELS, M. and MARCUS, B. (2016). Bayesian methods for nonignorable dropout in joint models in smok-

Antonio R. Linero is Assistant Professor, Department of Statistics, Florida State University, Tallahassee, Florida 32306, USA (e-mail: arlinero@stat.fsu.edu). Michael J. Daniels is Professor and Chair, Department of Statistics, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida 32611, USA (e-mail: mdaniels@stat.ufl.edu).

- ing cessation studies. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **111** 1454–1465. [MR3601701](#)
- HAREL, O. and SCHAFER, J. L. (2009). Partial and latent ignorability in missing-data problems. *Biometrika* **96** 37–50. [MR2482133](#)
- HAREL, O. and ZHOU, X.-H. (2007). Multiple imputation: Review of theory, implementation and software. *Stat. Med.* **26** 3057–3077. [MR2380504](#)
- HECKMAN, J. J. (1979). Sample selection bias as a specification error. *Econometrica* **47** 153–161. [MR0518832](#)
- HENDERSON, R., DIGGLE, P. J. and DOBSON, A. (2000). Joint modelling of longitudinal measurements and event time data. *Biostatistics* **1** 465–480.
- HOGAN, J. W. and LAIRD, N. M. (1997). Mixture models for the joint distribution of repeated measures and event times. *Stat. Med.* **16** 239–257.
- IBRAHIM, J. G., LIPSITZ, S. R. and CHEN, M.-H. (1999). Missing covariates in generalized linear models when the missing data mechanism is non-ignorable. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **61** 173–190. [MR1664045](#)
- IBRAHIM, J. G. and MOLENBERGHS, G. (2009). Missing data methods in longitudinal studies: A review. *Test* **18** 1–43. [MR2495958](#)
- KENWARD, M. G. (1998). Selection models for repeated measurements with non-random dropout: An illustration of sensitivity. *Stat. Med.* **17** 2723–2732.
- KENWARD, M. G., MOLENBERGHS, G. and THijs, H. (2003). Pattern-mixture models with proper time dependence. *Biometrika* **90** 53–71. [MR1966550](#)
- KIM, C., DANIELS, M. J., MARCUS, B. H. and ROY, J. A. (2017). A framework for Bayesian nonparametric inference for causal effects of mediation. *Biometrics* **73** 401–409. [MR3665957](#)
- LEACY, F. P., FLOYD, S., YATES, T. A. and WHITE, I. R. (2017). Analyses of sensitivity to the missing-at-random assumption using multiple imputation with delta adjustment: Application to a tuberculosis/HIV prevalence survey with incomplete HIV-status data. *Am. J. Epidemiol.* **185** 304–315.
- LIN, H., LIU, D. and ZHOU, X.-H. (2010). A correlated random-effects model for normal longitudinal data with nonignorable missingness. *Stat. Med.* **29** 236–247. [MR2750513](#)
- LINERO, A. R. (2017). Bayesian nonparametric analysis of longitudinal studies in the presence of informative missingness. *Biometrika* **104** 327–341. [MR3698257](#)
- LINERO, A. R. and DANIELS, M. J. (2015). A flexible Bayesian approach to monotone missing data in longitudinal studies with informative dropout with application to a schizophrenia clinical trial. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **110** 45–55.
- LINERO, A. R. and DANIELS, M. J. (2018). Supplement to “Bayesian approaches for missing not at random outcome data: The role of identifying restrictions.” DOI:10.1214/17-STS630SUPP.
- LITTLE, R. J. A. (1993). Pattern-mixture models for multivariate incomplete data. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **88** 125–134.
- LITTLE, R. J. A. (1994). A class of pattern-mixture models for normal incomplete data. *Biometrika* **81** 471–483. [MR1311091](#)
- LITTLE, R. J. (1995). Modeling the drop-out mechanism in repeated-measures studies. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **90** 1112–1121. [MR1354029](#)
- LIUBLINSKA, V. and RUBIN, D. B. (2014). Sensitivity analysis for a partially missing binary outcome in a two-arm randomized clinical trial. *Stat. Med.* **33** 4170–4185. [MR3267402](#)
- MENG, X.-L. (1994). Multiple-imputation inferences with uncongenial sources of input. *Statist. Sci.* **9** 538–558.
- MOLENBERGHS, G., MICHIELS, B., KENWARD, M. G. and DIGGLE, P. J. (1998). Monotone missing data and pattern-mixture models. *Stat. Neerl.* **52** 153–161. [MR1649081](#)
- MURRAY, J. S. and REITER, J. P. (2016). Multiple imputation of missing categorical and continuous values via Bayesian mixture models with local dependence. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **111** 1466–1479. [MR3601702](#)
- NATIONAL RESEARCH COUNCIL (2010). *The Prevention and Treatment of Missing Data in Clinical Trials*. The National Academies Press, Washington, DC.
- ROBINS, J. (1986). A new approach to causal inference in mortality studies with a sustained exposure period—Application to control of the healthy worker survivor effect. *Math. Model.* **7** 1393–1512. [MR0877758](#)
- ROBINS, J. M. (1997). Non-response models for the analysis of non-monotone non-ignorable missing data. *Stat. Med.* **16** 21–37.
- ROBINS, J. M., ROTNITZKY, A. and ZHAO, L. P. (1995). Analysis of semiparametric regression models for repeated outcomes in the presence of missing data. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **90** 106–121. [MR1325118](#)
- ROTNITZKY, A., ROBINS, J. M. and SCHARFSTEIN, D. O. (1998). Semiparametric regression for repeated outcomes with nonignorable nonresponse. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **93** 1321–1339. [MR1666631](#)
- ROY, J. (2003). Modeling longitudinal data with nonignorable dropouts using a latent dropout class model. *Biometrics* **59** 441–456. [MR2025106](#)
- ROY, J., LUM, K. J. and DANIELS, M. J. (2017). A Bayesian nonparametric approach to marginal structural models for point treatments and a continuous or survival outcome. *Biostatistics* **18** 32–47. [MR3612272](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (1976). Inference and missing data. *Biometrika* **63** 581–592. [MR0455196](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (1987). *Multiple Imputation for Nonresponse in Surveys*. Wiley, New York. [MR0899519](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (1996). Multiple imputation after 18+ years. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **91** 473–489.
- SADINLE, M. and REITER, J. P. (2017a). Itemwise conditionally independent nonresponse modeling for incomplete multivariate data. *Biometrika* **104** 207–220.
- SADINLE, M. and REITER, J. P. (2017b). Sequential identification of nonignorable missing data mechanisms. *Statist. Sinica* To appear.
- SCHARFSTEIN, D. O., ROTNITZKY, A. and ROBINS, J. M. (1999). Adjusting for nonignorable dropout using semiparametric nonresponse models. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **94** 1135–1146.
- SCHARFSTEIN, D., MCDERMOTT, A., OLSON, W. and WIEGAND, F. (2014). Global sensitivity analysis for repeated measures studies with informative dropout: A fully parametric approach. *Stat. Biopharm. Res.* **6** 338–348.
- SCHARFSTEIN, D., MCDERMOTT, A., DIAZ, I., CARONE, M., LUNARDON, N. and TURKOZ, I. (2018). Global sensitivity analysis for repeated measures studies with informative dropout: A semiparametric approach. *Biometrics* **74** 207–219.
- SEAMAN, S., GALATI, J., JACKSON, D. and CARLIN, J. (2013). What is meant by “missing at random”? *Statist. Sci.* **28** 257–268. [MR3112409](#)

- SETHURAMAN, J. (1994). A constructive definition of Dirichlet priors. *Statist. Sinica* **4** 639–650. [MR1309433](#)
- SHPITSER, I. (2016). Consistent estimation of functions of data missing non-monotonically and not at random. In *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems* 3144–3152.
- SI, Y. and REITER, J. P. (2013). Nonparametric Bayesian multiple imputation for incomplete categorical variables in large-scale assessment surveys. *J. Educ. Behav. Stat.* **38** 499–521.
- TCHETGEN TCHETGEN, E. J., WANG, L. and SUN, B. (2016). Discrete choice models for nonmonotone nonignorable missing data: Identification and inference. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1607.02631](#).
- THIJS, H., MOLENBERGHS, G., MICHIELS, B., VERBEKE, G. and CURRAN, D. (2002). Strategies to fit pattern-mixture models. *Biostatistics* **3** 245–265.
- TSIATIS, A. A. (2007). *Semiparametric Theory and Missing Data*. Springer, New York.
- VANSTEELANDT, S., ROTNITZKY, A. and ROBINS, J. M. (2007). Estimation of regression models for the mean of repeated outcomes under nonignorable nonmonotone nonresponse. *Biometrika* **94** 841–860. [MR2416795](#)
- VANSTEELANDT, S., GOETGHEBEUR, E., KENWARD, M. G. and MOLENBERGHS, G. (2006). Ignorance and uncertainty regions as inferential tools in a sensitivity analysis. *Statist. Sinica* **16** 953–979. [MR2281311](#)
- VAN BUUREN, S. (2012). *Flexible Imputation of Missing Data*. Chapman and Hall/CRC, Boca Raton, FL.
- WANG, C. and DANIELS, M. J. (2011). A note on MAR, identifying restrictions, model comparison, and sensitivity analysis in pattern mixture models with and without covariates for incomplete data. *Biometrics* **67** 810–818. [MR2829255](#)
- WANG, C., DANIES, M. J., SCHARFSTEIN, D. O. and LAND, S. (2010). A Bayesian shrinkage model for incomplete longitudinal binary data with application to the breast cancer prevention trial. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **105** 1333–1346. [MR2796554](#)
- WU, M. C. and CARROLL, R. J. (1988). Estimation and comparison of changes in the presence of informative right censoring by modeling the censoring process. *Biometrics* **45** 175–188. [MR0931633](#)
- XU, D., DANIELS, M. J. and WINTERSTEIN, A. G. (2016). Sequential BART for imputation of missing covariates. *Biostatistics* **17** 589–602. [MR3603956](#)

Causal Inference: A Missing Data Perspective

Peng Ding and Fan Li

Abstract. Inferring causal effects of treatments is a central goal in many disciplines. The potential outcomes framework is a main statistical approach to causal inference, in which a causal effect is defined as a comparison of the potential outcomes of the same units under different treatment conditions. Because for each unit at most one of the potential outcomes is observed and the rest are missing, causal inference is inherently a missing data problem. Indeed, there is a close analogy in the terminology and the inferential framework between causal inference and missing data. Despite the intrinsic connection between the two subjects, statistical analyses of causal inference and missing data also have marked differences in aims, settings and methods. This article provides a systematic review of causal inference from the missing data perspective. Focusing on ignorable treatment assignment mechanisms, we discuss a wide range of causal inference methods that have analogues in missing data analysis, such as imputation, inverse probability weighting and doubly robust methods. Under each of the three modes of inference—Frequentist, Bayesian and Fisherian randomization—we present the general structure of inference for both finite-sample and super-population estimands, and illustrate via specific examples. We identify open questions to motivate more research to bridge the two fields.

Key words and phrases: Assignment mechanism, ignorability, imputation, missing data mechanism, observational studies, potential outcome, propensity score, randomization, weighting.

REFERENCES

- ABADIE, A. and IMBENS, G. W. (2006). Large sample properties of matching estimators for average treatment effects. *Econometrica* **74** 235–267. [MR2194325](#)
- ABADIE, A. and IMBENS, G. (2011). Bias corrected matching estimators for average treatment effects. *J. Bus. Econom. Statist.* **29** 1–11. [MR2789386](#)
- ANDREWS, D. W. (2000). Inconsistency of the bootstrap when a parameter is on the boundary of the parameter space. *Econometrica* **68** 399–405. [MR1748009](#)
- ANGRIST, J. D., IMBENS, G. W. and RUBIN, D. B. (1996). Identification of causal effects using instrumental variables. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **91** 444–455. [MR3042387](#)
- ANGRIST, J. D. and PISCHKE, J.-S. (2008). *Mostly Harmless Econometrics: An Empiricist's Companion*. Princeton Univ. Press, Princeton, NJ.
- ATHEY, S. and IMBENS, G. W. (2015). Machine learning methods for estimating heterogeneous causal effects. Available at [arXiv:1504.01132](#).
- ATHEY, S., IMBENS, G. W. and WAGER, S. (2018). Approximate residual balancing: De-biased inference of average treatment effects in high dimensions. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* To appear. Available at <https://arxiv.org/abs/1604.07125>.
- ATHEY, S., IMBENS, G., PHAM, T. and WAGER, S. (2017). Estimating average treatment effects: Supplementary analyses and remaining challenges. *Am. Econ. Rev.* **107** 278–281.
- BANG, H. and ROBINS, J. M. (2005). Doubly robust estimation in missing data and causal inference models. *Biometrics* **61** 962–972. [MR2216189](#)
- BELLONI, A., CHERNOZHUKOV, V. and HANSEN, C. (2014). Inference on treatment effects after selection among high-dimensional controls. *Rev. Econ. Stud.* **81** 608–650. [MR3207983](#)

Peng Ding is Assistant Professor, Department of Statistics, University of California, Berkeley, 425 Evans Hall, Berkeley, California 94720, USA (e-mail: pengdingpku@berkeley.edu). Fan Li is Associate Professor, Department of Statistical Science, Duke University, 122 Old Chemistry Bldg, Durham, North Carolina 27708, USA (e-mail: fl35@duke.edu).

- BELLONI, A., CHERNOZHUKOV, V., FERNÁNDEZ-VAL, I. and HANSEN, C. (2017). Program evaluation and causal inference with high-dimensional data. *Econometrica* **85** 233–298. [MR3611771](#)
- BICKEL, P. J. and DOKSUM, K. A. (2015). *Mathematical Statistics: Basic Ideas and Selected Topics, Volume 1*, 2nd ed. CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL. [MR3445928](#)
- BLONIARZ, A., LIU, H., ZHANG, C.-H., SEKHON, J. S. and YU, B. (2016). Lasso adjustments of treatment effect estimates in randomized experiments. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **113** 7383–7390. [MR3531136](#)
- CARPENTER, B., GELMAN, A., HOFFMAN, M. D., LEE, D., GOODRICH, B., BETANCOURT, M., BRUBAKER, M., GUO, J., LI, P. and RIDDELL, A. (2017). Stan: A probabilistic programming language. *J. Stat. Softw.* **76** 1–32.
- CHAPIN, F. S. (1947). *Experimental Designs in Sociological Research*. Harper, New York.
- CHEN, H., GENG, Z. and ZHOU, X.-H. (2009). Identifiability and estimation of causal effects in randomized trials with noncompliance and completely nonignorable missing data. *Biometrics* **65** 675–682. [MR2649840](#)
- CHENG, J. and SMALL, D. S. (2006). Bounds on causal effects in three-arm trials with non-compliance. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **68** 815–836. [MR2301296](#)
- CHERNOZHUKOV, V., CHETVERIKOV, D., DEMIRER, M., DUFLO, E., HANSEN, C., NEWEY, W. and ROBINS, J. (2016). Double/debiased machine learning for treatment and causal parameters. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1608.00060](#).
- CHIB, S. and JACOBI, L. (2016). Bayesian fuzzy regression discontinuity analysis and returns to compulsory schooling. *J. Appl. Econometrics* **31** 1026–1047. [MR3556650](#)
- CHUNG, E. and ROMANO, J. P. (2013). Exact and asymptotically robust permutation tests. *Ann. Statist.* **41** 484–507. [MR3099111](#)
- COCHRAN, W. G. (1953). *Sampling Techniques*, 1st ed. Wiley, New York. [MR0054199](#)
- COCHRAN, W. G. (1957). Analysis of covariance: Its nature and uses. *Biometrics* **13** 261–281. [MR0090952](#)
- COCHRAN, W. G. (2007). *Sampling Techniques*, 3rd ed. Wiley, New York.
- CORNFIELD, J., HAENSZEL, W., HAMMOND, E. et al. (1959). Smoking and lung cancer: Recent evidence and a discussion of some questions. *J. Natl. Cancer Inst.* **22** 173–203.
- CRUMP, R. K., HOTZ, V. J., IMBENS, G. W. and MITNIK, O. A. (2009). Dealing with limited overlap in estimation of average treatment effects. *Biometrika* **96** 187–199. [MR2482144](#)
- DAWID, A. P. (2000). Causal inference without counterfactuals. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **95** 407–424. [MR1803167](#)
- DAWID, A. P. MUSIO, M. and MURTAS, R. (2017). The probability of causation. *Law, Probability and Risk* **16** 163–179.
- DEMPSTER, A., LAIRD, N. and RUBIN, D. B. (1977). Maximum likelihood from incomplete data via the EM algorithm. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **39** 1–38. [MR0501537](#)
- DING, P. (2014). Three occurrences of the hyperbolic-secant distribution. *Amer. Statist.* **68** 32–35. [MR3303831](#)
- DING, P. and DASGUPTA, T. (2016). A potential tale of two-by-two tables from completely randomized experiments. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **111** 157–168. [MR3494650](#)
- DING, P., FELLER, A. and MIRATRIX, L. (2016). Randomization inference for treatment effect variation. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **78** 655–671. [MR3506797](#)
- DING, P. and GENG, Z. (2014). Identifiability of subgroup causal effects in randomized experiments with nonignorable missing covariates. *Stat. Med.* **33** 1121–1133. [MR3247784](#)
- DING, P. and LU, J. (2017). Principal stratification analysis using principal scores. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **79** 757–777. [MR3641406](#)
- DING, P. and VANDERWEELE, T. J. (2016). Sensitivity analysis without assumptions. *Epidemiology* **27** 368–377.
- DING, P., GENG, Z., YAN, W. and ZHOU, X.-H. (2011). Identifiability and estimation of causal effects by principal stratification with outcomes truncated by death. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **106** 1578–1591. [MR2896858](#)
- DING, W. and SONG, P. X.-K. (2016). EM algorithm in Gaussian copula with missing data. *Comput. Statist. Data Anal.* **101** 1–11. [MR3504831](#)
- ELLIOTT, M., RAGHUNATHAN, T. and LI, Y. (2010). Bayesian inference for causal mediation effects using principal stratification with dichotomous mediators and outcomes. *Biostatistics* **11** 353–372.
- FAN, Y., GUERRE, E. and ZHU, D. (2017). Partial identification of functionals of the joint distribution of “potential outcomes”. *J. Econometrics* **197** 42–59. [MR3598644](#)
- FAN, Y. and PARK, S. S. (2010). Sharp bounds on the distribution of treatment effects and their statistical inference. *Econometric Theory* **26** 931–951.
- FELLER, A., GREIF, E., MIRATRIX, L. and PILLAI, N. (2016). Principal stratification in the twilight zone: Weakly separated components in finite mixture models. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1602.06595](#).
- FIRTH, D. and BENNETT, K. E. (1998). Robust models in probability sampling. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **60** 3–21. [MR1625672](#)
- FISHER, R. A. (1935). *The Design of Experiments*, 1st ed. Oliver and Boyd, Edinburgh.
- FRANGAKIS, C. and RUBIN, D. B. (1999). Addressing complications of intention-to-treat analysis in the combined presence of all-or-none treatment-noncompliance and subsequent missing outcomes. *Biometrika* **86** 365–378. [MR1705410](#)
- FRANGAKIS, C. and RUBIN, D. B. (2002). Principal stratification in causal inference. *Biometrics* **58** 21–29. [MR1891039](#)
- FRUMENTO, P., MEALLI, F., PACINI, B. and RUBIN, D. B. (2012). Evaluating the effect of training on wages in the presence of noncompliance, nonemployment, and missing outcome data. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **107** 450–466. [MR2980057](#)
- FRUMENTO, P., MEALLI, F., PACINI, B. and RUBIN, D. B. (2016). The fragility of standard inferential approaches in principal stratification models relative to direct likelihood approaches. *Stat. Anal. Data Min.* **9** 58–70. [MR3465093](#)
- GALLOP, R., SMALL, D., LIN, J., ELLIOT, M., JOFFE, M. and HAVE, T. T. (2009). Mediation analysis with principal stratification. *Stat. Med.* **28** 1108–1130. [MR2662200](#)
- GELFAND, A. and SMITH, A. (1990). Sampling-based approaches to calculating marginal densities. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **85** 398–409. [MR1141740](#)
- GELMAN, A., MENG, X.-L. and STERN, H. (1996). Posterior predictive assessment of model fitness via realized discrepancies (with discussion). *Statist. Sinica* **6** 733–807. [MR1422404](#)
- GELMAN, A., CARLIN, J. B., STERN, H. S., DUNSON, D. B., VEHTARI, A. and RUBIN, D. B. (2014). *Bayesian Data Analysis*, 3rd ed. Chapman & Hall/CRC, Boca Raton, FL. [MR2027492](#)

- GILBERT, P. and HUDGENS, M. (2008). Evaluating candidate principal surrogate endpoints. *Biometrics* **64** 1146–1154. [MR2522262](#)
- GRAHAM, B. S., DE XAVIER PINTO, C. C. and EGEL, D. (2012). Inverse probability tilting for moment condition models with missing data. *Rev. Econ. Stud.* **79** 1053–1079. [MR2986390](#)
- GRILLI, L. and MEALLI, F. (2008). Nonparametric bounds on the causal effect of university studies on job opportunities using principal stratification. *J. Educ. Behav. Stat.* **33** 111–130.
- GUSTAFSON, P. (2009). What are the limits of posterior distributions arising from nonidentified models, and why should we care? *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **104** 1682–1695. [MR2750585](#)
- GUSTAFSON, P. (2015). *Bayesian Inference for Partially Identified Models: Exploring the Limits of Limited Data*. CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL.
- HAHN, J. (1998). On the role of the propensity score in efficient semiparametric estimation of average treatment effects. *Econometrica* **66** 315–331. [MR1612242](#)
- HAINMUELLER, J. (2012). Entropy balancing for causal effects: A multivariate reweighting method to produce balanced samples in observational studies. *Polit. Anal.* **20** 25–46.
- HÁJEK, J. (1971). Comment on a paper by D. Basu. In *Foundations of Statistical Inference* (V. P. Godambe and D. A. Sprott, eds.) 236. Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Toronto.
- HECKMAN, J. J. (1979). Sample selection bias as a specification error. *Econometrica* **47** 153–161. [MR0518832](#)
- HECKMAN, J., LOPES, H. and PIATEK, R. (2014). Treatment effects: A Bayesian perspective. *Econometric Rev.* **33** 36–67. [MR3170840](#)
- HIRANO, K. and IMBENS, G. W. (2004). The propensity score with continuous treatments. In *Applied Bayesian Modeling and Causal Inference from Incomplete-Data Perspectives*. 73–84. Wiley, Chichester. [MR2134803](#)
- HIRANO, K., IMBENS, G. W. and RIDDER, G. (2003). Efficient estimation of average treatment effects using the estimated propensity score. *Econometrica* **71** 1161–1189. [MR1995826](#)
- HO, D. E., IMAI, K., KING, G. and STUART, E. A. (2011). MatchIt: Nonparametric preprocessing for parametric causal inference. *J. Stat. Softw.* **42** 1–28.
- HOEFFDING, W. (1952). The large-sample power of tests based on permutations of observations. *Ann. Math. Stat.* **23** 169–192. [MR0057521](#)
- HOLLAND, P. (1986). Statistics and causal inference (with discussion). *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **81** 945–970. [MR0867618](#)
- HORVITZ, D. and THOMPSON, D. (1952). A generalization of sampling without replacement from a finite universe. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **47** 663–685. [MR0053460](#)
- HUBER, P. J. (1967). The behavior of maximum likelihood estimates under nonstandard conditions. In *Proc. Fifth Berkeley Sympos. Math. Statist. and Probability* **1** 221–233. Univ. California Press, Berkeley, CA. [MR0216620](#)
- ICHINO, A., MEALLI, F. and NANNICINI, T. (2008). From temporary help jobs to permanent employment: What can we learn from matching estimators and their sensitivity? *J. Appl. Econometrics* **23** 305–327. [MR2420362](#)
- IMAI, K. (2008). Sharp bounds on the causal effects in randomized experiments with “truncation-by-death”. *Statist. Probab. Lett.* **78** 144–149. [MR2382067](#)
- IMAI, K. and RATKOVIC, M. (2014). Covariate balancing propensity score. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **76** 243–263. [MR3153941](#)
- IMAI, K. and VAN DYK, D. (2004). Causal treatment with general treatment regimes: Generalizing the propensity score. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **99** 854–866. [MR2090918](#)
- IMBENS, G. W. (2000). The role of the propensity score in estimating dose-response functions. *Biometrika* **87** 706–710. [MR1789821](#)
- IMBENS, G. W. (2003). Sensitivity to exogeneity assumptions in program evaluation. *Am. Econ. Rev.* **93** 126–132.
- IMBENS, G. W. (2004). Nonparametric estimation of average treatment effects under exogeneity: A review. *Rev. Econ. Stat.* **86** 4–29.
- IMBENS, G. W. and ANGRIST, J. (1994). Identification and estimation of local average treatment effects. *Econometrica* **62** 467–476.
- IMBENS, G. W. and RUBIN, D. B. (1997). Bayesian inference for causal effects in randomized experiments with noncompliance. *Ann. Statist.* **25** 305–327. [MR1429927](#)
- IMBENS, G. W. and RUBIN, D. B. (2015). *Causal Inference for Statistics, Social, and Biomedical Sciences: An Introduction*. Cambridge Univ. Press, New York. [MR3309951](#)
- KANG, J. D. and SCHAFER, J. L. (2007). Demystifying double robustness: A comparison of alternative strategies for estimating a population mean from incomplete data. *Statist. Sci.* **22** 523–539. [MR2420458](#)
- LI, X. and DING, P. (2017). General forms of finite population central limit theorems with applications to causal inference. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **112** 1759–1769. [MR3750897](#)
- LI, F., MATTEI, A. and MEALLI, F. (2015). Evaluating the causal effect of university grants on student dropout: Evidence from a regression discontinuity design using principal stratification. *Ann. Appl. Stat.* **9** 1906–1931. [MR3456358](#)
- LI, F., MORGAN, K. and ZASLAVSKY, A. (2018). Balancing covariates via propensity score weighting. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* To appear. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1080/01621459.2016.1260466>.
- LI, F., BACCINI, M., MEALLI, F., ZELL, E. R., FRANGAKIS, C. E. and RUBIN, D. B. (2014). Multiple imputation by ordered monotone blocks with application to the anthrax vaccine research program. *J. Comput. Graph. Statist.* **23** 877–892. [MR3224660](#)
- LIN, W. (2013). Agnostic notes on regression adjustments to experimental data: Reexamining freedman’s critique. *Ann. Appl. Stat.* **7** 295–318. [MR3086420](#)
- LINDLEY, D. V. (1972). *Bayesian Statistics: A Review*. SIAM, Philadelphia, PA. [MR0329081](#)
- LITTLE, R. J. (1988). Missing-data adjustments in large surveys. *J. Bus. Econom. Statist.* **6** 287–296.
- LITTLE, R. and AN, H. (2004). Robust likelihood-based analysis of multivariate data with missing values. *Statist. Sinica* **14** 949–968. [MR2089342](#)
- LITTLE, R. J. and RUBIN, D. B. (2002). *Statistical Analysis with Missing Data*, 2nd ed. Wiley-Interscience, Hoboken, NJ. [MR1925014](#)
- LIUBLINSKA, V. and RUBIN, D. B. (2014). Sensitivity analysis for a partially missing binary outcome in a two-arm randomized clinical trial. *Stat. Med.* **33** 4170–4185. [MR3267402](#)
- LU, J., DING, P. and DASGUPTA, T. (2015). Treatment effects on ordinal outcomes: Causal estimands and sharp bounds. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1507.01542](https://arxiv.org/abs/1507.01542).

- LUNCEFORD, J. K. and DAVIDIAN, M. (2004). Stratification and weighting via the propensity score in estimation of causal treatment effects: A comparative study. *Stat. Med.* **23** 2937–2960.
- MANSKI, C. F. (1990). Nonparametric bounds on treatment effects. *Am. Econ. Rev.* **80** 319–323.
- MATTEI, A. and MEALLI, F. (2011). Augmented designs to assess principal strata direct effects. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **73** 729–752. [MR2867456](#)
- MATTEI, A., MEALLI, F. and PACINI, B. (2014). Identification of causal effects in the presence of nonignorable missing outcome values. *Biometrics* **70** 278–288. [MR3258033](#)
- MEALLI, F. and RUBIN, D. B. (2015). Clarifying missing at random and related definitions, and implications when coupled with exchangeability. *Biometrika* **102** 995–1000. [MR3431570](#)
- MEALLI, F., IMBENS, G. W., FERRO, S. and BIGGERI, A. (2004). Analyzing a randomized trial on breast self-examination with noncompliance and missing outcomes. *Biostatistics* **5** 207–222.
- MEBANE, W. R. JR and POAST, P. (2013). Causal inference without ignorability: Identification with nonrandom assignment and missing treatment data. *Polit. Anal.* **21** 233–251.
- MENG, X.-L. (1994). Posterior predictive p -values. *Ann. Statist.* **22** 1142–1160. [MR1311969](#)
- MERCATANTI, A. (2004). Analyzing a randomized experiment with imperfect compliance and ignorable conditions for missing data: Theoretical and computational issues. *Comput. Statist. Data Anal.* **46** 493–509. [MR2061964](#)
- MERCATANTI, A. and LI, F. (2014). Do debit cards increase household spending? Evidence from a semiparametric causal analysis of a survey. *Ann. Appl. Stat.* **8** 2405–2508. [MR3292506](#)
- MERCATANTI, A. and LI, F. (2017). Do debit cards decrease cash demand? Causal inference and sensitivity analysis using principal stratification. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. C. Appl. Stat.* **66** 759–776. [MR3670416](#)
- MIRATRIX, L. W., SEKHON, J. S. and YU, B. (2013). Adjusting treatment effect estimates by post-stratification in randomized experiments. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **75** 369–396. [MR3021392](#)
- MITRA, R. and REITER, J. P. (2011). Estimating propensity scores with missing covariate data using general location mixture models. *Stat. Med.* **30** 627–641. [MR2767460](#)
- MITRA, R. and REITER, J. P. (2016). A comparison of two methods of estimating propensity scores after multiple imputation. *Stat. Methods Med. Res.* **25** 188–204.
- MOLINARI, F. (2010). Missing treatments. *J. Bus. Econom. Statist.* **28** 82–95. [MR2650602](#)
- MURRAY, J. S. and REITER, J. P. (2016). Multiple imputation of missing categorical and continuous values via Bayesian mixture models with local dependence. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **111** 1466–1479. [MR3601702](#)
- NEWBY, W. K. (1997). Convergence rates and asymptotic normality for series estimators. *J. Econometrics* **79** 147–168. [MR1457700](#)
- NEYMAN, J. (1935). Statistical problems in agricultural experimentation. *Suppl. J. R. Stat. Soc.* **2** 107–180.
- NEYMAN, J. (1990). On the application of probability theory to agricultural experiments. Essay on principles. Section 9. *Statist. Sci.* **5** 465–472. [MR1092986](#)
- NOLEN, T. L. and HUDGENS, M. G. (2011). Randomization-based inference within principal strata. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **106** 581–593. [MR2847972](#)
- QIN, J. (2017). *Biased Sampling, Over-Identified Parameter Problems and Beyond*. Springer, Singapore. [MR3675467](#)
- RICHARDSON, T. S., EVANS, R. J. and ROBINS, J. M. (2010). Transparent parameterizations of models for potential outcomes. In *Bayesian Statistics* **9** 569–610. Oxford Univ. Press, Oxford.
- RIDGEWAY, G., MCCAFFREY, D., MORRAL, A., GRIFFIN, B. A. and BURGETTE, L. (2017). *twang: Toolkit for Weighting and Analysis of Nonequivalent Groups*. R package version 1.5.
- ROBINS, J. M. (1986). A new approach to causal inference in mortality studies with sustained exposure periods—Application to control of the healthy worker survivor effect. *Math. Modelling* **7** 1393–1512. [MR0877758](#)
- ROBINS, J. M. and RITOV, Y. (1997). Toward a curse of dimensionality appropriate (CODA) asymptotic theory for semiparametric models. *Stat. Med.* **16** 285–319.
- ROBINS, J. M., ROTNITZKY, A. and SCHARFSTEIN, D. O. (2000). Sensitivity analysis for selection bias and unmeasured confounding in missing data and causal inference models. In *Statistical Models in Epidemiology, the Environment, and Clinical Trials* 1–94. Springer, New York. [MR1731681](#)
- ROBINS, J. M., ROTNITZKY, A. and ZHAO, L. P. (1995). Analysis of semiparametric regression models for repeated outcomes in the presence of missing data. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **90** 106–121. [MR1325118](#)
- ROBINS, J. M., VAN DER VAART, A. and VENTURA, V. (2000). Asymptotic distribution of p values in composite null models. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **95** 1143–1156. [MR1804240](#)
- ROSENBAUM, P. R. (1984a). Conditional permutation tests and the propensity score in observational studies. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **79** 565–574. [MR0763575](#)
- ROSENBAUM, P. R. (1984b). The consequences of adjustment for a concomitant variable that has been affected by the treatment. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **147** 656–666.
- ROSENBAUM, P. R. (1987). Sensitivity analysis for certain permutation inferences in matched observational studies. *Biometrika* **74** 13–26. [MR0885915](#)
- ROSENBAUM, P. R. (2002a). Covariance adjustment in randomized experiments and observational studies. *Statist. Sci.* **17** 286–327. [MR1962487](#)
- ROSENBAUM, P. R. (2002b). *Observational Studies*, 2nd ed. Springer, New York. [MR1899138](#)
- ROSENBAUM, P. R. (2010). *Design of Observational Studies*. Springer, New York. [MR2561612](#)
- ROSENBAUM, P. R. and RUBIN, D. B. (1983a). Assessing sensitivity to an unobserved binary covariate in an observational study with binary outcome. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **45** 212–218.
- ROSENBAUM, P. R. and RUBIN, D. B. (1983b). The central role of the propensity score in observational studies for causal effects. *Biometrika* **70** 41–55. [MR0742974](#)
- ROSENBAUM, P. R. and RUBIN, D. B. (1984). Reducing bias in observational studies using subclassification on the propensity score. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **79** 516–524.
- RUBIN, D. B. (1974). Estimating causal effects of treatments in randomized and nonrandomized studies. *J. Educ. Psychol.* **66** 688–701.
- RUBIN, D. B. (1975). Bayesian inference for causality: The role of randomization. In *Proceedings of the Social Statistics Section of the American Statistical Association* 233–239.

- RUBIN, D. B. (1976). Inference and missing data. *Biometrika* **63** 581–592. [MR0455196](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (1977). Assignment to a treatment group on the basis of a covariate. *Journal of Educational Statistics* **2** 1–26.
- RUBIN, D. B. (1978). Bayesian inference for causal effects: The role of randomization. *Ann. Statist.* **6** 34–58. [MR0472152](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (1979). Using multivariate matched sampling and regression adjustment to control bias in observational studies. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **74** 318–324.
- RUBIN, D. B. (1980). Comment on “Randomization analysis of experimental data: The Fisher randomization test” by D. Basu. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **75** 591–593.
- RUBIN, D. B. (1984). Bayesianly justifiable and relevant frequency calculations for the applied statistician. *Ann. Statist.* **12** 1151–1172.
- RUBIN, D. B. (1986). Statistical matching using file concatenation with adjusted weights and multiple imputations. *J. Bus. Econom. Statist.* **4** 87–94.
- RUBIN, D. B. (1998). More powerful randomization-based p -values in double-blind trials with non-compliance. *Stat. Med.* **17** 371–385.
- RUBIN, D. B. (2005). Causal inference using potential outcomes: Design, modeling, decisions. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **100** 322–331. [MR2166071](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (2006a). Causal inference through potential outcomes and principal stratification: Application to studies with “censoring” due to death. *Statist. Sci.* **91** 299–321. [MR2339125](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (2006b). *Matched Sampling for Causal Effects*. Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge. [MR2307965](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (2007). The design versus the analysis of observational studies for causal effects: Parallels with the design of randomized trials. *Stat. Med.* **26** 20–36. [MR2312697](#)
- RUBIN, D. B. (2008). For objective causal inference, design trumps analysis. *Ann. Appl. Stat.* **2** 808–840. [MR2516795](#)
- SCHARFSTEIN, D., ROTNITZKY, A. and ROBINS, J. M. (1999). Adjusting for nonignorable drop-out using semiparametric non-response models (with discussion). *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **94** 1096–1146. [MR1731478](#)
- SCHWARTZ, S., LI, F. and REITER, J. P. (2012). Sensitivity analysis for unmeasured confounding in principal stratification settings with binary variables. *Stat. Med.* **31** 949–962. [MR2913871](#)
- SEAMAN, S., GALATI, J., JACKSON, D. and CARLIN, J. (2013). What is meant by “missing at random”? *Statist. Sci.* **28** 257–268. [MR3112409](#)
- SEKHON, J. S. (2011). Multivariate and propensity score matching software with automated balance optimization: The matching package for R. *J. Stat. Softw.* **42** 1–52.
- STUART, E. (2010). Matching methods for causal inference: A review and a look forward. *Statist. Sci.* **25** 1–21. [MR2741812](#)
- TANNER, M. and WONG, W. (1987). The calculation of posterior distributions by data augmentation. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **82** 528–540. [MR0898357](#)
- TIBSHIRANI, R. (1996). Regression shrinkage and selection via the lasso. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **58** 267–288. [MR1379242](#)
- TSIATIS, A. A., DAVIDIAN, M., ZHANG, M. and LU, X. (2008). Covariate adjustment for two-sample treatment comparisons in randomized clinical trials: A principled yet flexible approach. *Stat. Med.* **27** 4658–4677. [MR2528575](#)
- TUKEY, J. W. (1993). Tightening the clinical trial. *Controlled Clinical Trials* **14** 266–285.
- VAN BUUREN, S. (2012). *Flexible Imputation of Missing Data*. CRC press, Boca Raton, FL.
- VAN DER LAAN, M. J. and ROSE, S. (2011). *Targeted Learning: Causal Inference for Observational and Experimental Data*. Springer, New York. [MR2867111](#)
- VANDERWEELE, T. (2008). Simple relations between principal stratification and direct and indirect effects. *Statist. Probab. Lett.* **78** 2957–2962. [MR2516810](#)
- WAGER, S., DU, W., TAYLOR, J. and TIBSHIRANI, R. J. (2016). High-dimensional regression adjustments in randomized experiments. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **113** 12673–12678. [MR3576188](#)
- WHITE, H. (1980). A heteroskedasticity-consistent covariance matrix estimator and a direct test for heteroskedasticity. *Econometrica* **48** 817–838. [MR0575027](#)
- YANG, S. and DING, P. (2018). Asymptotic causal inference with observational studies trimmed by the estimated propensity scores. *Biometrika*. To appear. Available at <https://arxiv.org/abs/1604.07125>.
- YANG, F. and SMALL, D. S. (2016). Using post-outcome measurement information in censoring-by-death problems. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **78** 299–318. [MR3453657](#)
- YANG, S., WANG, L. and DING, P. (2017). Nonparametric identification of causal effects with confounders subject to instrumental missingness. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1702.03951](https://arxiv.org/abs/1702.03951).
- ZHANG, G. and LITTLE, R. J. (2009). Extensions of the penalized spline of propensity prediction method of imputation. *Biometrics* **65** 911–918. [MR2649864](#)
- ZHANG, J. and RUBIN, D. B. (2003). Estimation of causal effects via principal stratification when some outcomes are truncated by “death”. *J. Educ. Behav. Stat.* **28** 353–358.
- ZHANG, J., RUBIN, D. B. and MEALLI, F. (2009). Likelihood-based analysis of the causal effects of job-training programs using principal stratification. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **104** 166–176.
- ZHANG, Z., LIU, W., ZHANG, B., TANG, L. and ZHANG, J. (2016). Causal inference with missing exposure information: Methods and applications to an obstetric study. *Stat. Methods Med. Res.* **25** 2053–2066. [MR3553326](#)
- ZHOU, J., ZHANG, Z., LI, Z. and ZHANG, J. (2015). Coarsened propensity scores and hybrid estimators for missing data and causal inference. *Int. Stat. Rev.* **83** 449–471. [MR3429286](#)
- ZIGLER, C. and BELIN, T. (2012). A Bayesian approach to improved estimation of causal effect predictiveness for a principal surrogate endpoint. *Biometrics* **68** 922–932. [MR3055197](#)
- ZUBIZARRETA, J. R. (2015). Stable weights that balance covariates for estimation with incomplete outcome data. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **110** 910–922. [MR3420672](#)

Flexible Low-Rank Statistical Modeling with Missing Data and Side Information

William Fithian and Rahul Mazumder

Abstract. We explore a general statistical framework for low-rank modeling of matrix-valued data, based on convex optimization with a generalized nuclear norm penalty. We study several related problems: the usual low-rank matrix completion problem with flexible loss functions arising from generalized linear models; reduced-rank regression and multi-task learning; and generalizations of both problems where side information about rows and columns is available, in the form of features or smoothing kernels. We show that our approach encompasses maximum a posteriori estimation arising from Bayesian hierarchical modeling with latent factors, and discuss ramifications of the missing-data mechanism in the context of matrix completion. While the above problems can be naturally posed as rank-constrained optimization problems, which are nonconvex and computationally difficult, we show how to relax them via generalized nuclear norm regularization to obtain convex optimization problems. We discuss algorithms drawing inspiration from modern convex optimization methods to address these large scale convex optimization computational tasks. Finally, we illustrate our flexible approach in problems arising in functional data reconstruction and ecological species distribution modeling.

Key words and phrases: Matrix completion, nuclear norm regularization, matrix factorization, convex optimization, missing data.

REFERENCES

- ABERNETHY, J., BACH, F., EVGENIOU, T. and VERT, J.-P. (2009). A new approach to collaborative filtering: Operator estimation with spectral regularization. *J. Mach. Learn. Res.* **10** 803–826.
- AGGARWAL, C. C. and CHEN, B.-C. (2009). Regression-based latent factor models. In *Proceedings of the 15th ACM SIGKDD International Conference on Knowledge Discovery and Data Mining* 19–28. ACM, New York.
- AGARWAL, D. K. and CHEN, B.-C. (2015). *Statistical Methods for Recommender Systems*. Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge.
- AGARWAL, D., ZHANG, L. and MAZUMDER, R. (2011). Modeling item–item similarities for personalized recommendations on Yahoo! front page. *Ann. Appl. Stat.* **5** 1839–1875. [MR2884924](#)
- ANDERSON, T. W. (1951). Estimating linear restrictions on regression coefficients for multivariate normal distributions. *Ann. Math. Stat.* **22** 327–351. [MR0042664](#)
- ANGST, R., ZACH, C. and POLLEFEYS, M. (2011). The generalized trace-norm and its application to structure-from-motion problems. In *2011 IEEE International Conference on Computer Vision (ICCV)* 2502–2509. IEEE, Los Alamitos, CA.
- ATCHADÉ, Y. F., MAZUMDER, R. and CHEN, J. (2015). Scalable computation of regularized precision matrices via stochastic optimization. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1509.00426](#).
- AUDIGIER, V., HUSSON, F. and JOSSE, J. (2016). A principal component method to impute missing values for mixed data. *Adv. Data Anal. Classif.* **10** 5–26. [MR3464297](#)
- BECK, A. and TBOULLE, M. (2009). A fast iterative shrinkage-thresholding algorithm for linear inverse problems. *SIAM J. Imaging Sci.* **2** 183–202. [MR2486527](#)
- BELL, R. M. and KOREN, Y. (2007). Lessons from the Netflix Prize Challenge. *ACM SIGKDD Explor. Newsl.* **9** 75–79.
- BENNETT, J. and LANNING, S. (2007). The Netflix Prize. In *Proceedings of KDD Cup and Workshop* 3–6. ACM New York.

William Fithian is Assistant Professor, Department of Statistics, University of California, Berkeley, 301 Evans Hall, Berkeley, California 94720, USA (e-mail: wfithian@berkeley.edu). Rahul Mazumder is Assistant Professor, Sloan School of Management, Operations Research Center and MIT Center for Statistics, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Building E62-583, 100 Main Street, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02142, USA (e-mail: rahulmaz@mit.edu).

- BERTSEKAS, D. P. (1999). *Nonlinear Programming*, 2nd ed. Athena Scientific, Belmont, MA. [MR3444832](#)
- BERTSIMAS, D., COPENHAVER, M. S. and MAZUMDER, R. (2017). Certifiably optimal low rank factor analysis. *J. Mach. Learn. Res.* **18** Paper No. 29. [MR3634896](#)
- BOTTOU, L. and BOUSQUET, O. (2008). The trade-offs of large scale learning. In *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems 20* (J. C. Platt, D. Koller, Y. Singer and S. T. Roweis, eds.) 161–168. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA.
- BOYD, S. and VANDENBERGHE, L. (2004). *Convex Optimization*. Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge. [MR2061575](#)
- BOYD, S., PARIKH, N., CHU, E., PELEATO, B. and ECKSTEIN, J. (2011). Distributed optimization and statistical learning via the alternating direction method of multipliers. *Found. Trends Mach. Learn.* **3** 1–122.
- BURER, S. and MONTEIRO, R. D. C. (2005). Local minima and convergence in low-rank semidefinite programming. *Math. Program.* **103** 427–444. [MR2166543](#)
- CAI, T. and ZHOU, W.-X. (2013). A max-norm constrained minimization approach to 1-bit matrix completion. *J. Mach. Learn. Res.* **14** 3619–3647. [MR3159403](#)
- CANDES, E. and PLAN, Y. (2010). Matrix completion with noise. *Proc. IEEE* **98** 925–936.
- CANDÈS, E. J. and RECHT, B. (2009). Exact matrix completion via convex optimization. *Found. Comput. Math.* **9** 717–772. [MR2565240](#)
- CANDÈS, E. J. and TAO, T. (2010). The power of convex relaxation: Near-optimal matrix completion. *IEEE Trans. Inform. Theory* **56** 2053–2080. [MR2723472](#)
- CANDÈS, E. J., LI, X., MA, Y. and WRIGHT, J. (2011). Robust principal component analysis? *J. ACM* **58** Art. ID 11. [MR2811000](#)
- CANDÈS, E. J., ELДАР, Y. C., STROHMER, T. and VORONINSKI, V. (2015). Phase retrieval via matrix completion [reprint of MR3032952]. *SIAM Rev.* **57** 225–251. [MR3345342](#)
- CARPENTIER, A., KLOPP, O., LÖFFLER, M. and NICKL, R. (2016). Adaptive confidence sets for matrix completion. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1608.04861](#).
- CHEN, Y. and WAINWRIGHT, M. J. (2015). Fast low-rank estimation by projected gradient descent: General statistical and algorithmic guarantees. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1509.03025](#).
- COTTET, V. and ALQUIER, P. (2018). 1-Bit matrix completion: PAC-Bayesian analysis of a variational approximation. *Mach. Learn.* **107** 579–603. [MR3761297](#)
- DAVENPORT, M. A., PLAN, Y., VAN DEN BERG, E. and WOOTTERS, M. (2014). 1-bit matrix completion. *Inf. Inference* **3** 189–223. [MR3311452](#)
- DE LEEUW, J. and VAN DER HEIJDEN, P. G. M. (1988). Correspondence analysis of incomplete contingency tables. *Psychometrika* **53** 223–233. [MR0955467](#)
- DEVOLDER, O., GLINEUR, F. and NESTEROV, Y. (2014). First-order methods of smooth convex optimization with inexact oracle. *Math. Program.* **146** 37–75. [MR3232608](#)
- FAZEL, M. (2002). Matrix rank minimization with applications. Ph.D. thesis, Stanford Univ.
- FITHIAN, W. and MAZUMDER, R. (2013). Scalable convex methods for flexible low-rank matrix modeling. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1308.4211](#).
- FITHIAN, W., ELITH, J., HASTIE, T. and KEITH, D. A. (2015). Bias correction in species distribution models: Pooling survey and collection data for multiple species. *Methods Ecol. Evol.* **6** 424–438.
- FOYGEL, R. and SREBRO, N. (2011). Concentration-based guarantees for low-rank matrix reconstruction. In *COLT* 315–340.
- FRANK, M. and WOLFE, P. (1956). An algorithm for quadratic programming. *Nav. Res. Logist. Q.* **3** 95–110. [MR0089102](#)
- FREUND, R. M., GRIGAS, P. and MAZUMDER, R. (2017). An extended Frank–Wolfe method with “in-face” directions, and its application to low-rank matrix completion. *SIAM J. Optim.* **27** 319–346. [MR3615468](#)
- GERRISH, S. and BLEI, D. M. (2011). Predicting legislative roll calls from text. In *Proceedings of the 28th International Conference on Machine Learning (ICML-11)* 489–496.
- GOLUB, G. H. and VAN LOAN, C. F. (1983). *Matrix Computations. Johns Hopkins Series in the Mathematical Sciences 3*. Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, Baltimore, MD. [MR0733103](#)
- HASTIE, T., BUJA, A. and TIBSHIRANI, R. (1995). Penalized discriminant analysis. *Ann. Statist.* **23** 73–102. [MR1331657](#)
- HASTIE, T., TIBSHIRANI, R. and WAINWRIGHT, M. (2015). *Statistical Learning with Sparsity: The Lasso and Generalizations. Monographs on Statistics and Applied Probability 143*. CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL. [MR3616141](#)
- HASTIE, T., MAZUMDER, R., LEE, J. D. and ZADEH, R. (2015). Matrix completion and low-rank SVD via fast alternating least squares. *J. Mach. Learn. Res.* **16** 3367–3402. [MR3450542](#)
- HUBER, P. J. (2011). *Robust Statistics*. Springer, New York.
- JAGGI, M. and SULOVSKE, M. (2010). A simple algorithm for nuclear norm regularized problems. In *Proceedings of the 27th International Conference on Machine Learning (ICML-10)* 471–478.
- JAIN, P., NETRAPALLI, P. and SANGHAVI, S. (2013). Low-rank matrix completion using alternating minimization (extended abstract). In *STOC’13—Proceedings of the 2013 ACM Symposium on Theory of Computing* 665–674. ACM, New York. [MR3210828](#)
- JOSSE, J. and HUSSON, F. (2012). Handling missing values in exploratory multivariate data analysis methods. *J. SFdS* **153** 79–99. [MR3008600](#)
- JOSSE, J., WAGER, S. and HUSSON, F. (2016). Confidence areas for fixed-effects PCA. *J. Comput. Graph. Statist.* **25** 28–48. [MR3474035](#)
- JOURNÉE, M., BACH, F., ABSIL, P.-A. and SEPULCHRE, R. (2010). Low-rank optimization on the cone of positive semidefinite matrices. *SIAM J. Optim.* **20** 2327–2351. [MR2678395](#)
- KESHAVAN, R. H., MONTANARI, A. and OH, S. (2010). Matrix completion from a few entries. *IEEE Trans. Inform. Theory* **56** 2980–2998. [MR2683452](#)
- KLOPP, O., LAFOND, J., MOULINES, É. and SALMON, J. (2015). Adaptive multinomial matrix completion. *Electron. J. Stat.* **9** 2950–2975. [MR3439190](#)
- KOREN, Y. (2010). Collaborative filtering with temporal dynamics. *Commun. ACM* **53** 89–97.
- KOREN, Y., BELL, R. and VOLINSKY, C. (2009). Matrix factorization techniques for recommender systems. *Computer* **42** 30–37.
- LAFOND, J. (2015). Low rank matrix completion with exponential family noise. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1502.06919](#).
- LARSEN, R. M. (2004). PROPACK—Software for large and sparse SVD calculations. Available at <http://sun.stanford.edu/~rmunk/PROPACK>.

- LEE, J., RECHT, B., SREBRO, N., TROPP, J. and SALAKHUTDINOV, R. (2010). Practical large-scale optimization for max-norm regularization. In *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems* 1297–1305.
- LESIEUR, T., KRZAKALA, F. and ZDEBOROVÁ, L. (2015). MMSE of probabilistic low-rank matrix estimation: Universality with respect to the output channel. In *2015 53rd Annual Allerton Conference on Communication, Control, and Computing (Allerton)* 680–687. IEEE, Los Alamitos, CA.
- MARDIA, K. V., KENT, J. T. and BIBBY, J. M. (1979). *Multivariate Analysis*. Academic Press, London. [MR0560319](#)
- MARTIN, A. D. and QUINN, K. M. (2002). Dynamic ideal point estimation via Markov chain Monte Carlo for the US Supreme Court, 1953–1999. *Polit. Anal.* **10** 134–153.
- MAZUMDER, R., HASTIE, T. and TIBSHIRANI, R. (2010). Spectral regularization algorithms for learning large incomplete matrices. *J. Mach. Learn. Res.* **11** 2287–2322. [MR2719857](#)
- MAZUMDER, R., RADCHENKO, P. and DEDIEU, A. (2017). Subset selection with shrinkage: Sparse linear modeling when the SNR is low. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1708.03288](#).
- MENON, A. K. and ELKAN, C. (2010). A log-linear model with latent features for dyadic prediction. In *2010 IEEE 10th International Conference on Data Mining (ICDM)* 364–373. IEEE, Los Alamitos, CA.
- NEGAHBAN, S. and WAINWRIGHT, M. J. (2012). Restricted strong convexity and weighted matrix completion: Optimal bounds with noise. *J. Mach. Learn. Res.* **13** 1665–1697. [MR2930649](#)
- NESTEROV, Y. (2004). *Introductory Lectures on Convex Optimization: A Basic Course. Applied Optimization* **87**. Kluwer Academic, Boston, MA. [MR2142598](#)
- NESTEROV, YU. (2005). Smooth minimization of non-smooth functions. *Math. Program.* **103** 127–152. [MR2166537](#)
- PARKER, J. T., SCHNITER, P. and CEVHER, V. (2014a). Bilinear generalized approximate message passing—Part I: Derivation. *IEEE Trans. Signal Process.* **62** 5839–5853. [MR3281527](#)
- PARKER, J. T., SCHNITER, P. and CEVHER, V. (2014b). Bilinear generalized approximate message passing—Part II: Applications. *IEEE Trans. Signal Process.* **62** 5854–5867. [MR3281528](#)
- REINSEL, G. C. and VELU, R. P. (1998). *Multivariate Reduced-Rank Regression: Theory and Applications. Lecture Notes in Statistics* **136**. Springer, New York. [MR1719704](#)
- RENNIE, J. and SREBRO, N. (2005). Fast maximum margin matrix factorization for collaborative prediction. In *ICML*.
- ROWEIS, S. (1998). EM algorithms for PCA and SPCA. In *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems* **10** 626–632. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA.
- RUBIN, D. B. (1976). Inference and missing data. *Biometrika* **63** 581–592. With comments by R. J. A. Little and a reply by the author. [MR0455196](#)
- SALAKHUTDINOV, R. and MNIH, A. (2008a). Bayesian probabilistic matrix factorization using Markov chain Monte Carlo. In *Proceedings of the 25th International Conference on Machine Learning* 880–887. ACM, New York.
- SALAKHUTDINOV, R. and MNIH, A. (2008b). Probabilistic matrix factorization. In *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems* **20** (J. C. Platt, D. Koller, Y. Singer and S. T. Roweis, eds.) 1257–1264. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA.
- SALAKHUTDINOV, R. and SREBRO, N. (2010). Collaborative filtering in a non-uniform world: Learning with the weighted trace norm. Preprint. Available at [arXiv:1002.2780](#).
- SREBRO, N., RENNIE, J. and JAAKKOLA, T. (2005). Maximum-margin matrix factorization. In *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems* **17** 1329–1336. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA.
- SREBRO, N. and SHRAIBMAN, A. (2005). Rank, trace-norm and max-norm. In *Learning Theory. Lecture Notes in Computer Science* **3559** 545–560. Springer, Berlin. [MR2203286](#)
- TIBSHIRANI, R. (1996). Regression shrinkage and selection via the lasso. *J. Roy. Statist. Soc. Ser. B* **58** 267–288. [MR1379242](#)
- TIPPING, M. E. and BISHOP, C. M. (1999). Probabilistic principal component analysis. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **61** 611–622. [MR1707864](#)
- TODESCHINI, A., CARON, F. and CHAVENT, M. (2013). Probabilistic low-rank matrix completion with adaptive spectral regularization algorithms. In *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems* 845–853.
- UDELL, M., HORN, C., ZADEH, R. and BOYD, S. (2016). Generalized low rank models. *Found. Trends Mach. Learn.* **9** 1–118.
- YANG, Y., MA, J. and OSHER, S. (2013). Seismic data reconstruction via matrix completion. *Inverse Probl. Imaging* **7** 1379–1392. [MR3180685](#)
- YEE, T. W. and HASTIE, T. J. (2003). Reduced-rank vector generalized linear models. *Stat. Model.* **3** 15–41. [MR1977163](#)
- YUAN, M., EKICI, A., LU, Z. and MONTEIRO, R. (2007). Dimension reduction and coefficient estimation in multivariate linear regression. *J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B. Stat. Methodol.* **69** 329–346. [MR2323756](#)

Missing Information Principle: A Unified Approach for General Truncated and Censored Survival Data Problems

Yifei Sun, Jing Qin and Chiung-Yu Huang

Abstract. It is well known that truncated survival data are subject to sampling bias, where the sampling weight depends on the underlying truncation time distribution. Recently, there has been a rising interest in developing methods to better exploit the information about the truncation time, thus the sampling weight function, to obtain more efficient estimation. In this paper, we propose to treat truncation and censoring as “missing data mechanism” and apply the missing information principle to develop a unified framework for analyzing left-truncated and right-censored data with unspecified or known truncation time distributions. Our framework is structured in a way that is easy to understand and enjoys a great flexibility for handling different types of models. Moreover, a new test for checking the independence between the underlying truncation time and survival time is derived along the same line. The proposed hypothesis testing procedure utilizes all observed data and hence can yield a much higher power than the conditional Kendall’s tau test that only involves comparable pairs of observations under truncation. Simulation studies with practical sample sizes are conducted to compare the performance of the proposed method with its competitors. The proposed methodologies are applied to a dementia study and a nursing house study for illustration.

Key words and phrases: Kendall’s tau, inverse probability weighted estimator, outcome-dependent sampling, prevalent sampling, self-consistency algorithm.

REFERENCES

- ADDONA, V. and WOLFSON, D. B. (2006). A formal test for the stationarity of the incidence rate using data from a prevalent cohort study with follow-up. *Lifetime Data Anal.* **12** 267–284. [MR2328577](#)
- ANDERSEN, P. K., BORGAN, Ø., GILL, R. D. and KEIDING, N. (1993). *Statistical Models Based on Counting Processes*. Springer, New York. [MR1198884](#)
- ASGHARIAN, M., M’LAN, C. E. and WOLFSON, D. B. (2002). Length-biased sampling with right censoring: An unconditional approach. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **97** 201–209. [MR1947280](#)
- BARTLETT, M. S. (1937). Some examples of statistical methods of research in agriculture and applied biology. *J. Roy. Statist. Soc. Ser. B* **4** 137–183.
- BEGUN, J. M., HALL, W. J., HUANG, W.-M. and WELLNER, J. A. (1983). Information and asymptotic efficiency in parametric–nonparametric models. *Ann. Statist.* **11** 432–452. [MR0696057](#)
- BHATTACHARYA, P. K., CHERNOFF, H. and YANG, S. S. (1983). Nonparametric estimation of the slope of a truncated regression. *Ann. Statist.* **11** 505–514. [MR0696063](#)
- DEMPSTER, A. P., LAIRD, N. M. and RUBIN, D. B. (1977). Max-

Yifei Sun is Assistant Professor, Department of Biostatistics, Mailman School of Public Health, Columbia University, New York, New York 10032, USA (e-mail: ys3072@cumc.columbia.edu). Jing Qin is Mathematical Statistician, Biostatistics Research Branch, National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, Maryland 20892, USA (e-mail: jingqin@niaid.nih.gov). Chiung-Yu Huang is Professor, Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, School of Medicine, University of California, San Francisco, San Francisco, California 94158, USA (e-mail: ChiungYu.Huang@ucsf.edu).

- imum likelihood from incomplete data via the EM algorithm. *J. Roy. Statist. Soc. Ser. B* **39** 1–38. [MR0501537](#)
- HUANG, C.-Y., NING, J. and QIN, J. (2015). Semiparametric likelihood inference for left-truncated and right-censored data. *Biostatistics* **16** 785–798. [MR3449843](#)
- HUANG, C.-Y. and QIN, J. (2012). Composite partial likelihood estimation under length-biased sampling, with application to a prevalent cohort study of dementia. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **107** 946–957. [MR3010882](#)
- HYDE, J. (1977). Testing survival under right censoring and left truncation. *Biometrika* **64** 225–230. [MR0494775](#)
- KENDALL, M. and GIBBONS, J. D. (1990). *Rank Correlation Methods*, 5th ed. Edward Arnold, London. [MR1079065](#)
- LANCASTER, T. (1990). *The Econometric Analysis of Transition Data. Econometric Society Monographs* **17**. Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge. [MR1167199](#)
- LUO, X. and TSAI, W. Y. (2009). Nonparametric estimation for right-censored length-biased data: A pseudo-partial likelihood approach. *Biometrika* **96** 873–886. [MR2767276](#)
- LYNDEN-BELL, D. (1971). Article navigation a method of allowing for known observational selection in small samples applied to 3CR quasars. *Mon. Not. R. Astron. Soc.* **155** 95–118.
- MARTIN, E. C. and BETENSKY, R. A. (2005). Testing quasi-independence of failure and truncation times via conditional Kendall’s tau. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **100** 484–492. [MR2160552](#)
- MCDOWELL, I., HILL, G. and LINDSAY, J. (2001). An overview of the Canadian study of health and aging. *Int. Psychogeriatr.* **13** 1–18.
- MURPHY, S. A. and VAN DER VAART, A. W. (2000). On profile likelihood. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **95** 449–485. [MR1803168](#)
- NING, J., QIN, J. and SHEN, Y. (2014). Score estimating equations from embedded likelihood functions under accelerated failure time model. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **109** 1625–1635. [MR3293615](#)
- OAKES, D. (2008). On consistency of Kendall’s tau under censoring. *Biometrika* **95** 997–1001. [MR2461227](#)
- ORCHARD, T. and WOODBURY, M. A. (1972). A missing information principle: Theory and applications. In *Proceedings of the Sixth Berkeley Symposium on Mathematical Statistics and Probability (Univ. California, Berkeley, Calif., 1970/1971), Vol. I: Theory of Statistics* 697–715. Univ. California Press, Berkeley, CA. [MR0400516](#)
- QIN, J., NING, J., LIU, H. and SHEN, Y. (2011). Maximum likelihood estimations and EM algorithms with length-biased data. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **106** 1434–1449. [MR2896847](#)
- SHEN, Y., NING, J. and QIN, J. (2017). Nonparametric and semi-parametric regression estimation for length-biased survival data. *Lifetime Data Anal.* **23** 3–24. [MR3601682](#)
- TSAI, W.-Y. (1990). Testing the assumption of independence of truncation time and failure time. *Biometrika* **77** 169–177. [MR1049418](#)
- TSAI, W. Y. (2009). Pseudo-partial likelihood for proportional hazards models with biased-sampling data. *Biometrika* **96** 601–615. [MR2538760](#)
- TSAI, W.-Y., JEWELL, N. P. and WANG, M.-C. (1987). A note on the product-limit estimator under right censoring and left truncation. *Biometrika* **74** 883–886.
- TURNBULL, B. W. (1976). The empirical distribution function with arbitrarily grouped, censored and truncated data. *J. Roy. Statist. Soc. Ser. B* **38** 290–295. [MR0652727](#)
- VARDI, Y. (1989). Multiplicative censoring, renewal processes, deconvolution and decreasing density: Nonparametric estimation. *Biometrika* **76** 751–761. [MR1041420](#)
- VARDI, Y. and ZHANG, C.-H. (1992). Large sample study of empirical distributions in a random-multiplicative censoring model. *Ann. Statist.* **20** 1022–1039. [MR1165604](#)
- WANG, M.-C. (1991). Nonparametric estimation from cross-sectional survival data. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **86** 130–143. [MR1137104](#)
- WANG, M.-C. (1996). Hazards regression analysis for length-biased data. *Biometrika* **83** 343–354. [MR1439788](#)
- WANG, M.-C., BROOKMEYER, R. and JEWELL, N. P. (1993). Statistical models for prevalent cohort data. *Biometrics* **49** 1–11. [MR1221402](#)
- YATES, F. (1933). The analysis of replicated experiments when the field results are incomplete. *Emp. J. Exp. Agric.* **1** 129–142.

Marie-France Bru and Bernard Bru on Dice Games and Contracts

Glenn Shafer

Abstract. This note introduces Marie-France and Bernard Bru’s forthcoming book on the history of probability, especially its chapter on dice games, translated in this issue of *Statistical Science*, and its commentary on the history of fair price in the settlement of contracts.

As the Brus remind us, the traditions of counting chances in dice games and estimating fair price came together in the correspondence between Pascal and Fermat in 1654. To solve the problem of dividing the stakes in a prematurely halted game, Fermat used combinatorial principles that had been used for centuries to analyze dice games, while Pascal used principles that had been proposed in previous centuries by students of commercial arithmetic.

Key words and phrases: Dice games, emergence of probability, *De vetula*, expectation.

REFERENCES

- [1] AL-KADI, I. A. Origins of cryptology: The Arab contributions. *Cryptologia* **16** 97–126.
- [2] AL KHALILI, J. (2011). *The House of Wisdom: How Arabic Science Saved Ancient Knowledge and Gave Us the Renaissance*. Penguin, New York.
- [3] AL KINDI (2004). *Al-Kindi’s Treatise on Cyptanalysis*. KFCRIS & KACST, Riyadh. Book One of the Series on Arabic Origins of Cryptology.
- [4] BELLHOUSE, D. R. (2000). *De vetula*: A medieval manuscript containing probability calculations. *Int. Stat. Rev.* **68** 123–136.
- [5] BERNOULLI, J. (1713). *Ars Conjectandi, Opus Posthumum. Accedit Tractatus de Seriebus Infinitis et Epistola Gallice Scripta de Ludo Pilae Reticularis*. Impensis Thurnisiorum fratrum, Basel. French translation by Jean Peyroux, Paris, A. Blanchard, 1998. English translation with notes by Edith Dudley Sylla, Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, MD, 2006.
- [6] BERNOULLI, J. (1969–1999). *Die Werke Von Jakob Bernoulli*. Birkhäuser, Basel. 6 volumes.
- [7] BRU, B., BRU, M.-F. and BIENAYMÉ, O. (1997). La statistique critiquée par le calcul des probabilités: Deux manuscrits inédits d’Irenée Jules Bienaymé. *Rev. Histoire Math.* **3** 137–239.
- [8] BRU, B., BRU, M.-F. and CHUNG, K. L. (1999). Borel et la martingale de Saint-Petersbourg. *Rev. Histoire Math.* **5** 181–247. Translated into English as “Borel and the Saint-Petersburg paradox” in *Electronic Journal for History of Probability and Statistics*, 5(1), 2009.
- [9] CARDANO, G. (1539). *Practica arithmeticae, & mensurandi singularis*. Castellioneus, Milan.
- [10] COUMET, E. (1965). Le problème des partis avant Pascal. *Arch. Int. Hist. Sci.* **18** 245–272. Reprinted on pages 73–95 of *Œuvres d’Ernest Coumet*, volume 1, *Presses universitaires de Franche-Comté*, 2016.
- [11] DAVID, F. N. (1962). *Games, Gods, and Gambling: The Origins and History of Probability and Statistical Ideas from the Earliest Times to the Newtonian Era*. Griffin, London.
- [12] EDWARDS, A. W. F. (2002). *Pascal’s Arithmetic Triangle: The Story of a Mathematical Idea*, 2nd ed.
- [13] FRANCI, R. (2002). Una soluzione esatta del problema delle parti in un manoscritto della prima metà del Quattrocento. *Boll. Stor. Sci. Mat.* **XXII** 253–266.
- [14] FRANKLIN, J. (2001). *The Science of Conjecture: Evidence and Probability Before Pascal*. Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, Baltimore, MD. Second edition 2015.
- [15] HACKING, I. (1975). *The Emergence of Probability*. Cambridge Univ. Press, New York. Second edition 2006.
- [16] HALD, A. (1990). *A History of Probability and Statistics and Their Applications Before 1750*. Wiley, New York.
- [17] HØYRUP, J. (2014). Fibonacci—Protagonist or witness? Who taught Catholic Christian Europe about Mediterranean commercial arithmetic? *J. Transcult. Mediev. Stud.* **1** 219–247.
- [18] HUYGENS, C. (1657). De Ratiociniis in Ludo Aleae. In *Exercitationum Mathematicarum, Liber V* (F. V. Schooten, ed.) 511–534. Elsevier, Leiden. The Dutch original, written in 1656, was published in Amsterdam in 1659 and reprinted along with a translation into French in Huygens’s *Œuvres*, volume 14, pages 1–91.

- [19] KENDALL, M. G. (1956). Studies in the history of probability and statistics: II. The beginnings of a probability calculus. *Biometrika* **43** 1–14. Reprinted in Pearson and Kendall, *Studies in the History of Statistics and Probability I*: 19–34.
- [20] KLOPSCH, P. (1967). *Pseudo-Ovidius De Vetula: Untersuchung und Text*. Brill, Leiden.
- [21] LACROIX, S. F. (1816). *Traité élémentaire du Calcul des Probabilités*. Courcier, Paris. Second edition 1822.
- [22] LAPLACE, P. S. (1814). *Essai Philosophique sur les Probabilités*, 1st ed. Courcier, Paris. The fifth and definitive edition appeared in 1825 and was reprinted in 1986 (Christian Bourgois, Paris) with a commentary by Bernard Bru. Multiple English translations have appeared.
- [23] LEWIS, D. L. (2008). *God's Crucible: Islam and the Making of Europe, 570–1215*. Norton, New York.
- [24] LUBBOCK, J. W. and DRINKWATER-BETHUNE, J. E. (1830). *On Probability*. Baldwin & Craddock, London.
- [25] MEUSNIER, N. (2007). Le problème des partis bouge... de plus en plus. *Electron. J. Hist. Probab. Stat.* **3**.
- [26] PACIOLI, L. (1494). *Summa de arithmetica, geometria, proportioni et proportionalità*. Paganino de Paganini, Venice.
- [27] PASCAL, B. (1665). *Traité du Triangle Artimétique et Traités Connexes*. Desprez, Paris.
- [28] ROBATHAN, D. M. (1968). *The Pseudo-Ovidian De Vetula: Text, Introduction, and Notes*. Hakkert, Amsterdam.
- [29] SALIBA, G. (2007). *Islamic Science and the Making of the European Renaissance*. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA.
- [30] SCHNEIDER, I. (1985). Luca Pacioli und das Teilungsproblem: Hintergrund und Lösungsversuch. In *Mathemata* (M. Folkerts and U. Lindgren, eds.). Steiner, Wiesbaden and Stuttgart.
- [31] SCHNEIDER, I., ed. (1988). *Die Entwicklung der Wahrscheinlichkeitstheorie Von Den Anfängen Bis 1933: Einführungen und Texte*. Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, Darmstadt.
- [32] SCHNEIDER, I. (1988). The market place and games of chance in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. In *Mathematics from Manuscript to Print, 1300–1600* (C. Hay, ed.) 220–235. Oxford.
- [33] SHAFER, G. and VOVK, V. (2001). *Probability and Finance: It's Only a Game!* Wiley, New York.
- [34] SHAFER, G. and VOVK, V. (2006). The sources of Kolmogorov's Grundbegriffe. *Statist. Sci.* **21** 70–98. [MR2275967](#)
- [35] SHAFER, G., VOVK, V. and TAKEMURA, A. (2012). Lévy's zero-one law in game-theoretic probability. *J. Theoret. Probab.* **25** 1–24. [MR2886375](#)
- [36] STIGLER, S. M. (2014). Soft question, hard answer: Jacob Bernoulli's probability in historical context. *Int. Stat. Rev.* **82** 1–16.
- [37] SWAN, E. J. (2000). *Building the Global Market: A 4000 Year History of Derivatives*. Kluwer Law International, The Hague.
- [38] SYLLA, E. (2003). Business ethics, commercial mathematics, and the origins of mathematical probability. *Hist. Polit. Econ.* **35** 309–337.
- [39] TARTAGLIA, N. (1556). *General Trattato di Numeri e Misura*. C. Troiano dei Navo, Venice.
- [40] TODHUNTER, I. (1865). *A History of the Mathematical Theory of Probability from the Time of Pascal to That of Laplace*. Macmillan, London.
- [41] TOTI RIGATELLI, L. (1985). Il 'problema delle parti' in manoscritti del XIV e XV secolo. In *Mathemata: Festschrift Für Helmuth Gericke* (M. Folkerts and U. Lindgren, eds.) 229–236. Steiner, Stuttgart.

Dice Games

Marie-France Bru and Bernard Bru

Abstract. Translated from the French by Glenn Shafer, the French text will appear as Chapter 1 of Volume 2 of *Les jeux de l'infini et du hasard*, by Marie-France and Bernard Bru, to be published by the Presses universitaires de Franche-Comté. The translation is published here with the permission of the publisher and the surviving author. The text has been edited to omit most references to other parts of the book. The authors extensive notes, which provide many additional references and historical details, have also been omitted.

Key words and phrases: *De vetula*, dice games, history of probability, Huygens, Jacob Bernoulli, Laplace, Montmort, normal approximation.

REFERENCES

- [1] BERNELIN (STUDENT OF GERBERT D' AURILLAC C. 1000) (1999). *Libre d'abaque*. Princi Néguer, Pau. Latin and French text established by B. Bakhouche with complementary notes by J. Cassinet.
- [2] ALLARD, A. (1992). *Muhammad Ibn Musa Al-Khwarizmi. Le Calcul Indien (Algorismus)*. A. Blanchard, Paris. Edition, with French translation and commentary, of the oldest Latin versions going back to the XIIth century.
- [3] ALLARD, A. (1994). *L'enseignement du calcul arithmétique à partir des XIIIe et XIIIe siècles: L'exemple de la multiplication*. Publications de l'Institut d'Etudes Médiévales, Université Catholique de Louvain, No. 16.
- [4] ALLARD, A. (1997). L'influence des mathématiques arabes dans l'occident médiéval. In *Histoire des Sciences Arabes* (R. Rashed and R. Morelon, eds.) 2 199–230. Seuil, Paris.
- [5] BEAUJOUAN, G. (1991). *Par Raison de Nombres, L'art du Calcul et des Savoirs Scientifiques Médiévaux*. Gower, Aldershot.
- [6] BEAUJOUAN, G., CARBONNE, P., CASSINET, J. et al. (1995). *Huit Siècles de Mathématiques en Occitanie*. CIHSO, Toulouse. Reprinted by Monein, Pyrémone, 2008.
- [7] BELLHOUSE, D. R. (2011). *Abraham De Moivre: Setting the Stage for Classical Probability and Its Applications*. CRC, Boca Raton, FL.
- [8] BERNOULLI, J. (1713). *Ars conjectandi, opus posthumum. Accedit Tractatus de seriebus infinitis et epistola Gallice scripta De ludo pilae reticularis*. Impensis Thurmisionum Fratrum, Basel. French translation by J. Peyroux, A. Blanchard, Paris, 1998. English translation with notes by E. D. Sylla, Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, Baltimore, 2006.
- [9] BERNOULLI, N. (1709). De usu artis conjectandi in jure. Doctoral thesis, Basel. Reprinted in *Die Werke von Jakob Bernoulli* 3 (1975) 287–326. French translation with notes by N. Meusnier, Paris, CAMS, 1992.
- [10] BIGGS, N. L. (1979). The roots of combinatorics. *Historia Mathematica* 6 109–136. DOI:10.1016/0315-0860(79)90074-0.
- [11] BOETHIUS, A. M. S. (1995). *De Institutione Arithmetica*. Les Belles Lettres, Paris. French translation and notes by J.-Y. Guillaumin.
- [12] BOREL, É. (1909). *Éléments de la Théorie des Probabilités*. Hermann, Paris. Further editions in 1910 and 1924, and 1950. The 1950 edition, published by Albin Michel, was translated into English by J. E. Freund and published by Prentice Hall, Englewood Cliffs, 1965.
- [13] BOREL, É. (1920). Radioactivité, probabilité et déterminisme. *Rev. Mois* 21 33–40. Reproduced as note I of the 1924 edition of [12] and in volume 4 of [14], pages 2189–2196.
- [14] BOREL, É. (1972). *Œuvres D'Émile Borel*. CNRS, Paris. 4 volumes.
- [15] COURNOT, A. (1828). De la théorie des probabilités considérée comme la matière d'un enseignement. *Le Lycée* 2 447–453. Reprinted in Volume 11 of [17].
- [16] COURNOT, A. (1843). *Exposition de la Théorie des Chances et des Probabilités*. Hachette, Paris. Reprinted with notes and index as Volume 1 of [17].
- [17] COURNOT, A. (1973–2010). *Œuvres Complètes*. Vrin and Presses Universitaires de Franche-Comté, Paris and Besançon. 11 titles in 13 volumes.
- [18] DE MOIVRE, A. (1710–1712) De mensura sortis, seu de probabilitate eventuum in ludis a casu fortuito pendentibus. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond.* 27 213–264.
- [19] DE MOIVRE, A. (1718). *The Doctrine of Chances: Or, A Method of Calculating the Probability of Events in Play*. W. Pearson, London. Later editions in 1738 and 1756.

Marie-France Bru was formerly at UFR de mathématiques, Université Paris Diderot, France. She died on January 30, 2012. Bernard Bru is retired from MAP5, Université Paris Descartes, 45 rue des Saints-Pères, 75006 Paris, France (e-mail: leslogesb@gmail.com).

- [20] DE MONTMORT, P. R. (1708). *Essay d'analyse sur les jeux de hazard*. Quillau, Paris. Published anonymously. Second edition in 1713.
- [21] DJEBBAR, A. (1985). *L'analyse combinatoire au Maghreb: L'exemple d'Ibn Mun'im (XIIe–XIIIe s.)*. Publications Mathématiques D'Orsay, number 85-01.
- [22] GUILLAUMIN, J.-Y. (2012). Boethius's *De institutione arithmetica* and its influence on posterity. In *A Companion to Boethius in the Middle Ages* (N. H. Kaylor and P. E. Phillips, eds.) 135–162. Brill, Leiden.
- [23] HAGSTROEM, K. G. (1932). *Les préludes antiques de la théorie des probabilités*. Fritze, Stockholm.
- [24] HALD, A. (1990). *A History of Probability and Statistics and Their Applications Before 1750*. Wiley, New York.
- [25] HUYGENS, C. (1657). *De ratiociniis in ludo aleae*. In *Exercitationum Mathematicarum, Liber V* (F. van Schooten, ed.) 511–534. Elsevier, Leiden. The Dutch original, written in 1656, was published in Amsterdam in 1660 and reprinted along with a translation into French in Huygens's *Œuvres*, volume 14, pages 1–91.
- [26] LAPLACE, P.-S. (1878–1912). *Œuvres complètes*. Gauthier-Villars, Paris. 14 volumes.
- [27] LAPLACE, P. S. (1812). *Théorie Analytique des Probabilités*. Courcier, Paris. Later editions in 1814, 1820, and 1825. The 1825 edition was reprinted in Volume 7 of [26].
- [28] MONTUCLA, J.-É. (1802). *Histoire des mathématiques*. H. Agasse, Paris. Completed and published by J. de Lalande, 4 volumes.
- [29] PACIOLI, L. (1498). *Divina Proportione*. Manuscript, Milan. First published by Paganini, Venice, 1509. Facsimile and French translation by G. Duchesne and M. Giraud, with a historical introduction by M.-T. Sarrade, Librairie du Compagnonnage, Paris, 1988.
- [30] STIGLER, S. M. (2014). Soft question, hard answer: Jacob Bernoulli's probability in historical context. *Int. Stat. Rev.* **82** 1–16.
- [31] STIGLER, S. M. (2016). *The Seven Pillars of Statistical Wisdom*. Harvard Univ. Press, Cambridge, MA.

INSTITUTE OF MATHEMATICAL STATISTICS

(Organized September 12, 1935)

The purpose of the Institute is to foster the development and dissemination of the theory and applications of statistics and probability.

IMS OFFICERS

President: Alison Etheridge, Department of Statistics, University of Oxford, Oxford, OX1 3LB, United Kingdom

President-Elect: Xiao-Li Meng, Department of Statistics, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138-2901, USA

Past President: Jon Wellner, Department of Statistics, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington 98195-4322, USA

Executive Secretary: Edsel Peña, Department of Statistics, University of South Carolina, Columbia, South Carolina 29208-001, USA

Treasurer: Zhengjun Zhang, Department of Statistics, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wisconsin 53706-1510, USA

Program Secretary: Judith Rousseau, Université Paris Dauphine, Place du Maréchal DeLattre de Tassigny, 75016 Paris, France

IMS EDITORS

The Annals of Statistics. *Editors:* Edward I. George, Department of Statistics, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104, USA; Tailen Hsing, Department of Statistics, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109-1107, USA

The Annals of Applied Statistics. *Editor-in-Chief:* Tilmann Gneiting, Heidelberg Institute for Theoretical Studies, HITS gGmbH, Schloss-Wolfsbrunnenweg 35, 69118 Heidelberg, Germany

The Annals of Probability. *Editor:* Amir Dembo, Department of Statistics and Department of Mathematics, Stanford University, Stanford, California 94305, USA

The Annals of Applied Probability. *Editor:* Bálint Tóth, School of Mathematics, University of Bristol, University Walk, BS8 1TW, Bristol, United Kingdom, and Alfréd Rényi Institute of Mathematics, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Budapest, Hungary

Statistical Science. *Editor:* Cun-Hui Zhang, Department of Statistics, Rutgers University, Piscataway, New Jersey 08854, USA

The IMS Bulletin. *Editor:* Vlada Limic, DR2, CNRS, Université Paris Sud 11, UMR 8628, Département de Mathématiques, 91405 Orsay, France



IMS members get a
40% discount
Order your copy now from
cambridge.org/ims

BRADLEY EFRON
TREVOR HASTIE

COMPUTER AGE STATISTICAL INFERENCE

ALGORITHMS, EVIDENCE, AND DATA SCIENCE